

GENERAL
LC/CAR/G.585
30 November 1999
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

**ACHIEVING GENDER EQUALITY:
A PRELIMINARY DOCUMENTATION ON THE USE OF GENDER PLANNING
AS PART OF THE GENDER MAINSTREAMING PROCESS
AMONG SELECTED CARIBBEAN COUNTRIES**

Acknowledgement

This study documents the field work in gender mainstreaming in five countries and was used in the preparation of the ECLAC/CDCC secretariat 10-country study in gender mainstreaming in the Caribbean. The United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) Subregional Headquarters for the Caribbean wishes to acknowledge the assistance of Ms. Sonja Harris, Development Planner, in the preparation of this report.

ACHIEVING GENDER EQUALITY: A PRELIMINARY DOCUMENTATION ON THE USE OF GENDER PLANNING AS PART OF THE GENDER MAINSTREAMING PROCESS AMONG SELECTED CARIBBEAN COUNTRIES

SECTION I

Introduction

The Mission to examine the experience of gender mainstreaming in selected member countries of the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean/Caribbean Development and Cooperation Committee (ECLAC/CDCC) began on 30 August 1999 with Jamaica and continued in the field from 5 – 19 September in Montserrat, St Kitts/Nevis, Saint Lucia and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines.

The assignment also required comparative analysis of:

- (a) Most effective/least effective practices observed;
- (b) An assessment of impact (from the process) on the position of women in the countries and on the existing mechanism for women's advancement; and
- (c) Policy recommendations for the next five years.

Key informants

In each country, the person responsible for women's affairs (Director/Coordinator), a representative from the Ministry of Planning and from the main Non-Governmental Women's Organization, were interviewed. Permanent secretaries, statisticians, financial secretary, legal officers, heads of related Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and staff of related ministries, including Agriculture, Housing and Community Services, were also interviewed.

General observations

(a) In terms of understanding the concept and process of "gender mainstreaming" *Montserrat* was the country least exposed to the required approaches and St Kitts/Nevis and Jamaica were the most advanced in the understanding and application of the process. *St Kitts/Nevis* had just completed a 10-month hosting of a Commonwealth Secretarial sponsored technical assistance assignment on Gender Management Systems (GMS) and the hosting of two workshops on Gender in Finance & Budgeting.

In the case of *Jamaica*, the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) sponsored assignment to mainstream gender analysis into planning is underway with a Gender Equity Instrument recently designed to be tested with planners at the Planning Institute of Jamaica (PIOJ) who manage and oversee large-scale investment projects.

St Kitts/Nevis was the most advanced in piloting gender analysis of budgets of three sectors – Ministries of Health, Education and Agriculture. Results are not yet known.

In spite of these initiatives in Jamaica and St Kitts/Nevis, however, the process of gender mainstreaming is far from systemic and evidence of fragmentation in programming still persists.

Montserrat was the least exposed because of:

(i) their unilateral focus on the crisis – attending volcano eruptions since June 1995; as well as

(ii) the weak structure in place prior to the volcano with no clearly assigned government machinery for women's affairs. This was the only Caribbean country where Women's Affairs was always an added responsibility for the Principal Community Development Officer. This Officer was unable, at the last minute, to attend the Fourth World Conference on Women. As a result, information dissemination on regional and global commitments pertinent to gender mainstreaming could not be given priority attention. The country is slowly recovering from its life-threatening crisis that has dislocated the entire society and rendered two-thirds of the land mass unusable.

At the same time, small population, ease of communication, a friendly family-type atmosphere and sound capacities among policy maker, senior administrator, planner and related technical officers, place Montserrat in a strong position for succeeding in gender mainstreaming. Once the commitment is made to include "gender" as a factor in economic and social analysis and in the social economic and physical capital restoration process in which the country is currently engaged, Montserrat could well challenge itself to become a model for the region.

Saint Lucia and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines fall in the middle range of the countries examined in their mainstreaming process and accomplishments. Saint Vincent and the Grenadines is in the stronger position of the two where stability and focus of the government machinery is concerned, but Saint Lucia, with an Economic Planner as Permanent Secretary, has the potential to recover from setbacks from changes in staffing and political administration.

(b) In summary, the countries are at different stages in their shift from a focus on Women in Development (WID) to Gender & Development (GAD), but all countries display limitations in their understanding of the technical policy/planning requirements of both the WID and GAD approaches.

There is some confusion in the region as to:

- (i) The legitimacy of continuing to focus on women given male “underachievement” in education;
- (ii) The perception that male/female *relations* are the correct interpretation of the “gender” focus;
- (iii) The perceived need to reach out to men in programming; e.g., in Health as women and children are already receiving services; and
- (iv) Whether service delivery, or integrating “the gender factor” in planning and programming, is the way to go and what organizational structure is required to manage the priority focus.

This confusion has had a direct impact on the quality of programming in the region.

Section II will include discussions on the effectiveness of the gender mainstreaming process using the following headings:

- (a) Applications in the Gender Mainstreaming Process
- (b) Organizational Structures
- (c) Organizational Capacity
- (d) Linkages between Stakeholders
- (e) Results in Gender Mainstreaming

The paper will conclude with Section III dealing with:

- (a) Impact Assessment; vis-a-vis Status of Women and existing mechanism; and
- (b) Policy Recommendations

SECTION II

1. The matrix below presents, in summary form, some of the findings from the five countries followed by detailed discussion.

Chart 1
Summary Indicators on Effectiveness of Gender Mainstreaming (National Machinery)

<u>Indicators</u>	<u>Jamaica</u>	<u>Montserrat</u>	<u>St Kitts/Nevis</u>	<u>Saint Lucia</u>	<u>Saint Vincent and the Grenadines</u>
Familiarity with concept*	4	1	3.5	2	2.5
Applications in the Gender Mainstreaming Process ^{vv}	2.5	N/A (Pre-volcano = 1)	2.5	2	2
Organizational Structures 1 - 4 (highest)	Comprehensive staffing New modern facilities Executive Director Fragmentation in Government Structure 3	Subject area "added on" to Community Services Good support possible at Permanent Secretary & Ministry level 2	Status gained from Ministry name Staff increase approved Advisory Council recently formed STRUCTURE is in place 3	Advantage of name change (of Dept & Ministry) and new location in multi-service Ministry to be demonstrated Consensus needed on direction Staffing adequate once Director position filled Permanent Secretary has relevant technical background 2	A stable Coordinator & Asst. Coordinator with continuity in knowledge base Advisory Committee - preparatory to Beijing - upgraded to a Commission Intra-Ministry communications not consistent 3
Organizational Capacity (Government)	Technical skills in data & policy analysis need strengthening at Bureau of Women's Affairs and in related Ministries.	Capacity in Gender Mainstreaming not clear in Community Services. Capacity in planning more than adequate.	Technical focus on data management and policy recommendations strengthening. New staff would need these skills.	Some skills/understanding of gender analysis evident. A systemic approach with Ministry of Planning is needed.	Skills in policy analysis & gender planning and links with central planning need strengthening.
Non-Government	Currently weak funding suspended in main organization. Fair in others.	No specific NGO in National Machinery. In related NGOs, capacity is moderate.	NACGEE [^] is new, fledgling, technical focus, research skills, funding needed.	New revitalizing; technical focus needed; self-perception of needing Government subvention. WID focus.	Commission officially suspended awaiting Cabinet approval. Capacity is evident. Focus needed.
Stakeholder Linkages	Sporadic only "as needed".	Not applicable	Sporadic - early days in terms of GMS focus.	Reservation on both sides created a barrier. New trust needed between Government and NCW.	Good working relationship with the Commission. Fair with the Council on Women.
Results	Gender Mainstreaming indicator and monitoring tool designed for Planning Institute.	Women seen as equal beneficiaries in an emergency situation; concern for the elderly.	Gender Management System (as a structure) in place. High level of sensitization.	Output limited in last 2 years to upgrading staff. Strategy now to be identified and tested.	Results evident in many sectors but in a non-systemic way.
KEY	1 = Limited knowledge 2 = Some knowledge 3 = Fair amount of knowledge 4 = Good amount of knowledge 5 = Full understanding	vv	1 = Fragmented with WID services predominant 2 = Fragmented with WID & GAD approaches evident 3 = GAD approach some WID -- a non-systemic approach 4 = A systemic GAD approach	^NACGEE National Advisory Council on Gender Equality & Equity	

2. Familiarity with the gender mainstreaming concept (all countries)

Of the countries which thought they understood the concept (all except Montserrat) Jamaica, at the level of the Planning Institute, came closest to a definition of “*ensuring that gender considerations are taken in the development of policies, plans and programmes*”. One Jamaican NGO also placed gender mainstreaming in the context of female subordination. All other countries interpreted the concept as “involving men in services and programmes,” so as to create balance in the relationship between men and women.

Planners in all countries, however, not only understand the concept when discussed, but in St Kitts/Nevis, Saint Lucia, St Vincent and the Grenadines and Montserrat, the role of the Social Planner is now being planned for and posts may soon be filled. It is in the context of the proposed integration of economic and social planning that gender analysis and planning is best appreciated by planners.

Montserrat has a clearly defined sustainable development planning framework; Saint Lucia – an integrated planning development framework and St Kitts/Nevis and St Vincent and the Grenadines will be able to move in a similar direction, once social planner positions are filled. Jamaica, which has a long established Social Planning Unit – alongside Economic Planning and Technical Cooperation – as part of the Planning Institute, faces a challenge now of a restructured and reformed Institute with merged Divisions. The integrated approach in Jamaica has yet to be tested as well as the gender-mainstreaming instrument recently designed (Harris/CIDA). The Office of the Prime Minister, the Policy Analysis & Review Unit, has a clear understanding and focus on gender mainstreaming but recognizes that capacity in the ministries is weak.

The difference between the gender mainstreaming strategy and services for men and women is not well understood in the region, thus making inter-country comparison difficult.

2.1 Montserrat

(a) Applications in the gender mainstreaming process

Montserrat is reported by Community Services to be currently planning to establish a Gender Desk to work on policies affecting women and children. The consensus in Montserrat is that there is no discrimination against women particularly in employment as women fill most top positions in Government. Two out of four permanent secretaries are women and one out of four Ministers is a woman. Community services see ‘Violence against Women’ as the critical area to be focussed on as the incidence of violence is often covered up.

Agriculture was one sector where sex disaggregated data was available, but in emergency planning and housing – the other critical sectors in this reconstruction phase – it was only after families were evacuated to shelters that gender sensitive issues became evident. These include:

- (i) Family separation (women were initially left behind, later men were left as women and children migrated);
- (ii) Trauma of disintegration of kinship ties;
- (iii) Impact of trauma on males and females – increased alcoholism (m) depression (f)
- (iv) Privacy – especially sexually;
- (v) Additional burdens on women to care for shelter residents;
- (vi) Impact on youth, especially males, who now show early signs of emotional disturbance, delinquency, and now dependency; and
- (vii) Pregnancies and births taking place in the shelters.

In shelter allocation, a point system is used to determine need. Female headship coupled with affordability, factor in the determination around locating a family in one type of house/community or another.

The critical area where gender mainstreaming is need in Montserrat is in analyzing the movement of its human resources. The country has had to face human and physical resource losses as well as a sense of loss over the measure of decision-making authority formerly exercised, as the country submits to the wider ranging imperatives of the United Kingdom's overseas Development Assistance programme through Department for International Development (DFID). Within that context, in the course of discussions, it was recognized that gender analysis and planning could inform the process of reconstruction, contribute to an updated data management system and guarantee equity in resource distribution and services.

(b) Organizational structure & capacity

There are indications, at the Ministry level, that one of the three Community Development Officers will be assigned to the “Gender Desk”.

With the country's and Community Services' focus on vulnerable groups, such as:

- (i) Youth – small numbers getting into difficulties and appearing in court;
- (ii) Elderly – abandoned or vulnerable after the hurricane, and now relocated in excellent Golden Age facilities;
- (iii) Girls – some of whom got pregnant while in shelters; and
- (iv) Female heads of households – who may have lost jobs in tourism or housekeeping;

The Gender Desk may find it impelling to offer services to particular groups rather than to integrating gender into planning.

Technical capacity in gender analysis, planning and monitoring could be built, but the country would need to consider whether that aspect of gender mainstreaming is as important as service delivery.

(c) Linkages with stakeholders

Links with policy makers, permanent secretaries, planning unit, Red Cross - Christian council, small business/credit, agriculture & housing reallocations sectors were all effected to facilitate this assignment. Theoretically, then, the country has stakeholder interest that can be mobilized. The issue for Montserrat, however, is one of focus. Currently, inter-agency and inter-sectoral linkages are more for the purpose of:

- (i) Reallocating farmers – male & female;
- (ii) Allocating housing to the most vulnerable including assigning the elderly, formerly cared for by family and community, to Government institutions; and
- (iii) Dealing with the psychic trauma of loss and dislocation to which staff themselves are not immune than in ensuring gender equity in operational procedures.

(d) Results in gender mainstreaming

Montserrat has just established a committee for youth and one for women. Whereas the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the visible problems of youth resettling in school and community informs the Youth Committee, the one on Women does not have the focus on absorbing the

Platform for Action, CARICOM Plan of Action or CEDAW or on prioritizing the action steps required from the complex menu of inter-sectoral demands.

The clearest results in gender mainstreaming were seen in:

(i) Agriculture where some sex disaggregated data is kept. In a sector formerly encompassing nearly 50 per cent female farmers (reduced from an estimated 400 to only approximately 80) with only 25 per cent female farmers having registered for assistance from the Ministry of Agriculture. Sector assessment is that volcano death, land loss and migration have impacted heavily on the farming community;

(ii) Housing allocation where some disaggregated data by age, sex and means are used as indicators for new shelter provision;

(iii) Credit data - National Development Foundations keeps records on loans by sex of borrower and type of enterprise. (Except for the area of fishing, women and men borrow equally); and

(iv) Growing sensitivity to the needs of women and children in shelters and in the post-crisis recovery period; e.g., women lost private sector jobs early and have had more responsibilities for families.

In none of the above cases has any sectoral or integrated analysis been attempted, but the country seems willing to have formal training in the rationale for and use of gender mainstreaming.

Case study – Montserrat

The depopulation in Montserrat (from 10,200 – 3,000) since the volcano began erupting in 1995 has mostly affected the age group up to 45 years. The population remaining, therefore, was predominantly the elderly. Some migrant families have been returning with their children, which is seen as an encouraging sign. Services and physical infrastructure have been severely affected as follows:

(i) Educational facilities and programmes – 6 of 7 primary schools, 6th form and the Community College have been destroyed or are being used as shelters

(ii) A food voucher system has created a new layer of dependency among able-bodied youth;

(iii) The capital city and all its structures and services have been destroyed;

(iv) Investments in residential properties and businesses, including residential tourism, were lost and prime real estate and trading activities are literally buried under some six feet of ash;

(v) The entire loan portfolio of the National Development Foundation (among others) was forfeited as 90 per cent of their clients migrated. NDF was left with land as security – land that is unusable in the danger zone.

(vi) In spite of a smaller population, social and community services have more cases to handle than before;

(vii) Farm lands and the farming community were destroyed with limited possibility of re-establishing the level of farm output on the remaining one-third of the island; and

(viii) The central (food) marketing system has been replaced by a retail system that moves with the flow of population movement. Food production and sales have new configurations and are more individualized.

Social and family relations have also been radically affected and a society with strong features of gender equality (in agriculture, public service, family life) is now facing a de facto situation of re-introduced colonial aid with accompanying structures of decision making which are, at best, benignly patriarchal. In such a situation of crisis management, the importance and role of women in the pre-volcano social structure could be inadvertently eroded or overlooked. Elderly women, for example, now represent a significant proportion of the current population, but their former role in communities as a wise or inter-dependent force has been replaced by the dependency of this age group on the state and a sense of isolation as family members have been forced to move on.

As younger women with school-age children return, a new level of dependency accompanies their return as housing and services are needed.

Counseling programmes, planned by the state and NGOs, such as Red Cross and the Christian Council, will have to confront complex social problems – the role of men and women in changing family forms being only one critical area.

Men and women in shelters not only lost the status of their former social roles, but were (initially) deprived of the privacy, purpose and controls in their lives to which they were accustomed. While men would leave shelters to meet for recreation, women assumed daily care for the more needy.

At the level of management, the crisis in Montserrat has had the effect of lumping all groups together. This, however, is not much different from the rest of the region where differential analysis has not been systematized.

What is indicated sharply in the case of Montserrat, but is reflected regionally, is the fact that – as described by one Permanent Secretary – outdated structures and institutional forms are being applied to new social challenges and to a crisis that permeates all aspects of life.

The Social Welfare Review 1998, a Price Waterhouse & Coopers Report, prepared for the Government and for DFID recognizes the shift in social relations from a highly family and community driven interdependent society to one now where dependency on the state is growing. Although the Report devotes some discussion to gender analysis and women, the wealth of data presented is not disaggregated by sex or age. Further, the principles seen as desirable in a proposed integrated social welfare system do not specify gender equity, but speak of helping people out of dependency, reaffirming family and community structures and offering impartial and sustainable services. Plans for Integrated Social Welfare and Sustainable Development programming present Montserrat with the unique opportunity of assessing, preserving and enhancing gender roles and opportunities in the rebuilding of their country.

2.2 ST KITTS/NEVIS

(a) Applications in the gender mainstreaming process

Imbalances in gender equity are presented in the following terms:

- (i) Women not responding as men are to small farm development strategy;
- (ii) No women in political office of 11 elected Parliamentarians;
- (iii) Of the five appointed positions (Senators, Attorney General, Speaker of the House), two are women. The Senate, however, is part of the House of Parliament and does not have independent sittings;
- (iv) Voters' list not disaggregated by age, sex or profession;
- (v) There are no female CEOs in the private sector. In banks after some 30 years of service, only one woman has made it to the level of Assistant manager and one woman heads the credit card company after returning from study abroad; and
- (vi) The playing field in Education has been leveled since 1965 with universal and compulsory education up to age 16, yet no female emerging from

the education system, where girls are reported to be “outperforming” boys, is able to hold top positions in the labour market.

Imbalances exist, therefore, in the wage structure of males and females in both the public and private sector but detailed analysis is needed. Household workers and non-unionized factory workers are among the most vulnerable. One popular private sector company is allowed to collect salary deductions on credit/purchase accounts at work-base, yet there is resistance in the judiciary to requiring salary deductions for child support at work base.

No formal study has been done on the situation of poverty, a situation exacerbated by the incidence of teenage pregnancies. Data management systems are inadequate as no single year analysis is done to inform on the extent and impact of statutory rape. Instead, data on pregnant girls is categorized as under 15 and 15 years and over. There is also perceived lack of uniformity in the law, as the age of consent for sexual activity is 16 years while the age of majority for voting is 18 years.

The incidence of violence against women is considered as a serious issue for this country, but hard data is not available.

In light of this and other problems, a Commonwealth Secretariat GMS has been introduced to St Kitts/Nevis that provides for the following:

(i) Gender focal points in the Ministries of Health, Education, Labour, Agriculture and Finance & Planning composed of Heads of Departments responsible for day-to-day mainstreaming operations;

(ii) Gender management Team, comprising Permanent Secretaries, who will direct the GMS programme; and

(iii) A National Advisory Council on Gender Equity/Equality (NACGEE) whose functions are to provide information/advise Government on appropriate action in various sectors and play an advocacy role with the media. NACGEE has formed seven focus groups as follows:

- (a) Poverty
- (b) Health
- (c) Education
- (d) Capacity Building
- (e) Violence against Women
- (f) Legal Affairs
- (g) Leadership & power sharing

Each grouping above (a, b & c) has met once since the Consultant’s departure in July. Meetings should be monthly.

In addition, the Ministries of Agriculture, Health & Education have been selected as pilot Ministries for the engendering of their budgets to determine any unplanned for areas of inequities. This follows two workshops by another Commonwealth Secretariat Consultant on gender analysis in finance and budgeting.

The Ministry of Finance's Five Year Development Plan 1996 – 2000 is also on record as committed to integrating gender analysis and planning in its development programmes; identifying and removing any obstacles to women's and girls' equal participation in economic, social and political life and strengthening. Government's capacity to implement the GMS.

In response to the situation of women's (and men's) legal status, the Domestic Violence Bill has been drafted, public education on Sexual Harassment has started and the Social Assistance Act (1998) providing for child maintenance has been passed.

The Government of St Kitts/Nevis is committed to gender mainstreaming at the highest level and all technical persons contacted for this assignment demonstrate a high level of awareness and willingness to engage in the process. Much work needs to be done, however, in the area of legal review and reform and in testing the GMS.

(b) Organizational structures

St Kitts/Nevis was the first Caribbean Country to have a full Ministry of Women's Affairs & Health since the mid-1980s that was headed by a woman. Other senior positions then held by females included Permanent Secretaries and the Labour Commissioner.

Under this current administration, the Ministry is now renamed Health & Women's Affairs (reversal in priority). The GMS is seen as an organized strategy which has permeated the entire public sector and sections of the private sector.

Women's Affairs now functioning as a Department in the Ministry is expected to coordinate all aspects of the GMS including a management team (PSs), Departmental Heads – Focal Points, and NACGEE. Staffing currently includes the Director and one multipurpose programme assistant. Three new positions were requested in the 1999/2000 budget: Administrative Assistant, Deputy Directory and Project Manager. The first two of which have been approved and will be on board this year. The last position will be filled in 2001.

The duties attached to the two new posts will focus heavily on the maintenance, monitoring and evaluation of the gender mainstreaming programmes, managing of data coming out of the GMS, and liaising with

NACGEE. The coherence of this structure with lower-level civil servants coordinating information from higher placed administrators will have to be tested.

(c) Organizational capacity

As per one technocrat, "*The impact of the sensitization program through the GMS can hardly be measured*". Issues of transformation, humanizing the development and justice are understood. *The challenge is the technical process.*

Capacity is difficult to measure at this stage as structures are still being put in place. Issues of leadership and followers, authority and influence, vision and skill will challenge St Kitts/Nevis during this period of GMS testing. NACGEE is already floundering because of inexperience, lack of focus and absence of firm leadership. Data, for example, to inform the Poverty Committee of NACGEE is not readily available nor do they have the research capacity to complement any National Assessment on Poverty with in-depth community analysis.

Capacity in the Department, responsible for Women's Affairs to review legal documents and assess social implications of current laws, may need to be strengthened.

No mention of these specific areas of skill is made in the job descriptions of the proposed two new staff members.

(d) Stakeholder linkages

As one technocrat put it – links between planning, participation (civil society), resource distribution and support services need to be made. This concept and use of linkages would go beyond structures. Strategic thinking is not very evident.

Inter-departmental and inter-ministry linkages appear to be obstacle-free on the surface. Political party polarization could be one main obstacle. Links between the governmental machinery and the newly formed Advisory Council appear fragile in this early stage.

(e) Results

(i) The formal adoption of the GMS. A heavily structured approach in gender mainstreaming is evident. Technical capacity exists within the GMS network. The results of the *process* are yet to be demonstrated. Issues of leadership, indicators for measurement, prioritizing of goals and strategies do not yet present themselves in a coherent system.

Other specific results since 1995 include:

- (i) Education Policy guaranteeing continued education of teenage mothers and return to school after giving birth;
- (ii) Opening of a Women's Centre in 1996 modeled on Jamaica's Women's Centre;
- (iii) Legal Reform – draft bill on domestic Violence and Social Assistance Act; and
- (iv) Gains women have made in post-secondary education especial distance learning and extra-mural (evening) classes;

Resource person (in GMS network) who teaches course on Human Rights to new police recruits.

2.3 Saint Vincent and the Grenadines

(a) Applications in the gender mainstreaming process

This country has come to its own understanding of gender mainstreaming through its very focus on women over the years. In treating with issues of maintenance, violence against women, parenting, sexual division of labour and poverty, the Department has repeatedly had to broaden its focus to deal with the relationship between men and women. Reaching out to men and women in training programming and policy work is seen as desirable in creating balance and working towards shared responsibility (a priority of the Platform for Action).

This understanding of gender mainstreaming limits applications, however, to more practical service delivery rather than strategic analysis and policy recommendations.

Some strategic work has, however, been addressed in the area of legal and policy reform including:

- (i) In 1997: A joint publication by Coordinator of Women's Affairs – Oliviene & McDonald – on "*Vincentian Women and the Law*" – supported by the ILO;
- (ii) In 1996: Publication on "*Understanding Domestic Violence*" by J James – Assistant Coordinator, Women's Affairs;
- (iii) The revision of the Domestic Violence Bill;

(iv) Upgrading of the Preparatory Committee for the Fourth World Conference to a Commission on Gender Equality;

(v) Revision of the Draft Policy on Women to a Proposed National Policy on Gender Equality;

(vi) Preparations to adopt a GMS as part of country strategy in sustainable development;

(vii) Gender focal points established in each Ministry and in each of 18 communities;

(viii) Links with Planning Ministry effected since Commonwealth Secretariat meeting in Malta 1996 and a more visible attempt at data collection and analysis;

(ix) Government's policy to continue its Land Reform Programme started in the early 1980s but focusing land distribution strategy on young women. (Inter-generational succession in agriculture is not automatic and many young women prefer, in fact, to travel to town for opportunities as minimum wage earners);

(x) Training of 24 women in non-traditional skills such as tiling, plumbing, electrical installation, painting;

(xi) Offering training and extension services support to female farmers (60% farmers are female). This strategy does not seem to be broadbased. One female farmer visited has been able to sustain and diversify her farm following the fall in banana prices; and

(xii) Public education and awareness programmes that are ongoing.

(b) Organizational structure

The structure, where direct responsibility for Women's Affairs lies, comprises:

(i) A Coordinator who liaises with the Permanent Secretary;

(ii) An Assistant Coordinator;

(iii) A Field Officer; and

(iv) A Secretary

Other arms of the national machinery include the Commission, which structure is now awaiting formal Cabinet approval, and the National Council of Women – the umbrella NGO for some 33 organizations. It is through the Commission and the proposed Gender Focal points that multi-sectoral representation is guaranteed. The Commission has public and private sector representatives: Statistics/Planning, Foreign Affairs, Legal Affairs, Community Development, Education, Health & Human Rights, Labour Union; Housing, the Media and Commerce. UNESCO also has a representative on the Commission.

(c) Organizational capacity

Capacity in the Department of Women's Affairs is sound and recent training, undergone by Coordinator and Assistant Coordinator in the last four years, has brought issues of strategic value into focus. A consistent mechanism is not, however, being used within the Department to monitor data or do strategic follow-up work.

Links with the Planning Ministry (Director of Planning is a woman) are in place, but a programme of joint systemic data management and analysis is not evident. Some interpretations given to females numerical dominance in participation in Education and Health Services indicate the need for technical capacity to be sharpened beyond quantitative measurements of inputs. Output/outcome analysis is weak.

(d) Stakeholder linkages

Linkages with the Commission seem to be sound and ongoing. There is no sense here of tokenism. Links with the National Council of Women are not as strong and may bring less status rewards than the more professional Commission. At the same time, the Department of Women's Affairs recognizes the need of the NCW for technical support.

Inter-ministry linkages – e.g., with Legal Department and Planning – appear to be issue specific and there is no system in place yet to follow up on:

- (i) Data on court cases of abuse, incest, violence, convictions, and family-impact;
- (ii) Data through Tracer Studies on labour market experience of the 24 women trained in non-traditional skills and lessons learned;
- (iii) The high rate of unemployment and targeted goals in poverty reduction; and
- (iv) Women in agriculture, as a sub-sector, outside of specific rural groups of women to whom assistance is offered. Their demand for

roads, markets need to be channeled formally to the Ministry of Agriculture (not represented on the Commission).

(e) Results

Preparations are in place in Saint Vincent and the Grenadines for a formal programme of GMS. However, the absence of both a Social Planner in the Planning Ministry (funds are in place to hire an Integrated Planner) or of a framework for jointly (with the Department) measuring inputs and outputs in gender mainstreaming limit results.

Faulty or inadequate data sets or indicators for analysis could mislead the national machinery in Saint Vincent and the Grenadines in thinking that services, predominantly used by females, now need to be offered to men to create balance.

The most obvious result then is the greater awareness of gender equity issues that has permeated all segments of the society; the structural preparations for a GMS; legal reform – e.g., revision in the Domestic Violence Bill; the phenomenon of male “midwives” and males in the beauty and fitness industry; and the women trained in industrial trades – e.g., plumbing – including the female chief engineer who recently headed a school construction project.

A baseline on Poverty (urban and rural features) and equity issues in the labour market could give this country a focused starting point on which to build their monitoring work.

2.4 Saint Lucia

(a) Applications in the Gender Mainstreaming Process

This country has had many levels of experience since the mid-1980s starting with years when the focus was on:

	Women in Development (projects)
then on	Developing Policy on women to a growing understanding of Gender Mainstreaming

However, due to changes in leadership (i.e., policy makers and recent retirement of the Director), Ministry location and Departmental name change and in the focused activities of the main umbrella NGO, a systemic programme of gender analysis and policy influence, or of select service delivery informed by data, is not in place.

There are pockets of understanding of gender mainstreaming, but the Department of Gender Relations is now adjusting to new staffing arrangements that will continue until a team is in place. A retreat is planned to create a consensual vision of the work ahead.

The national machinery as it regroups, under the guidance of a technically trained permanent secretary, sees value in the policy and planning approach as well as in supporting or initiating needed services to women; e.g., a women's shelter. This country has the youngest female minister and female permanent secretary in the region.

(b) Organizational Structure

The national machinery in Saint Lucia comprises the now renamed: Department of Gender Relations which functions in a Ministry of Health, Human Services, Family Affairs and Gender Relations. This complex menu, though covering inter-related subject areas, may result in subsuming under service-oriented departments the work of gender mainstreaming which is more technical. In the Department is a vacant Director position and two Women's Affairs Officers, one of whom is acting as Officer-in-Charge. Both Officers have just completed course requirements for their first degree.

Other arms of the national machinery include:

(i) Other Government departments and ministries, particularly ministries responsible for Planning, Education, Tourism & Community Services; and

(ii) The main NGO – the National Council of Women that is revitalizing after a period of dormancy.

(c) Organizational Capacity

One of the two officers at the Department has had over ten (10) years of service in women's affairs. She has been exposed, both in regional workshops and in the course work for a first degree, to the shift in thinking from the WID approach of meeting women's practical needs to the more strategic focus on redressing inequity and subordination.

Technical capacity among technocrats in Health, Education & Planning and senior administrators in Health, Tourism & Public Services is highly developed.

In Health, there is some understanding of gender analysis (after exposure to a UNFPA model) and of gender-related issues of Health and Productivity. There is also a routinized daily to quarterly data collection system. However,

their awareness of gender considerations is limited to an expressed need to reach out to older males and youth who use clinic and educational services less than women.

In **Education**, the perception that girls are outperforming boys has led to a planned World Bank Gender Study on disparities between boys and girls in performance. However, this enquiry is driven by external funding and other areas of analysis, such as: subjects selected by girls versus boys, curricula/text book bias, the relevance of teaching methods to boys' needs, male and female labour market positioning given girls "superior" performance and the ratio of secondary school male principals (47%) compared to primary school male principals (10%) have not become routinized areas of research and analysis within this sector.

In **Tourism**, the new administration, represented by the P.S. seems receptive to the concept of gender mainstreaming and of the importance of gender analysis on issues of investment and ownership patterns and labour positioning within the sector.

In **Public Services**, the pattern of feminization of the government service is apparent. Yet only three out of 14 permanent secretaries and two out of 16 parliamentarians are female. The trend favours men even at the deputy permanent secretary level. Women's "glass ceiling" operates above the level of Heads of Departments. There is recognition that, as the socio-cultural patterns change in the society, more in-depth analysis beyond "head counts" would be needed.

In **Planning**, two divisional programmes- Development Cooperation and Sustainable Development are strategically positioned and technically competent to engineer and advance the process of gender mainstreaming. However, there is recognition that, although some projects have attempted to target specific groups, the process of gender mainstreaming has not been institutionalized within the context of the overall strategy in Planning. Initiatives such as:

- (i) The Proposed Integrated Development Planning Approach;
- (ii) The Population & Poverty Eradication Policies;
- (iii) The OECS Social Indicator Programme; and
- (iv) The Social Reform Commission (which has been dormant) was recommended as structures which could be utilized for gender mainstreaming.

The challenge for Saint Lucia, then, is not one of capacity, but of an appropriate framework for operationalizing gender mainstreaming and an

agreed-on structure which is self propelling, iterative and interactive, given the Department's (Gender Relations) fledgling capacity in guiding this technical process.

(d) Stakeholders Linkages

These linkages were operationalized for the purpose of my visit. To that same extent, they can be mobilized for common interests of the groupings concerned about social and gender equity. The challenge is in the commitment to a common purpose of social/gender equity.

(e) Results

These can be summarized as follows:

- (i) Greater public awareness of the problems faced by women and men;
- (ii) An acceleration in women's mobility towards senior positions in the past three (3) years;
- (iii) The deepening commitment of Regional/International Agencies to supporting the examination of inequity and new approaches in redressing this; e.g., DFID, USAID, EU, OECS, OAS, among others;
- (iv) Social indicators being developed by OECS with gender indicators included.
- (v) The positioning of the Planning Ministry and willingness to include gender analysis in its proposed Integrated Development Programme; and
- (vi) The passage of the Domestic Violence Act and the establishment of the Family Court.

2.5 Jamaica

(a) Applications in the Gender Mainstreaming Process

In Jamaica, different initiatives are being managed by different arms of the national machinery. There is no one coordinated approach. Some of the strategies include the following:

Bureau of Women's Affairs (BWA)

- (i) Piloting the gender management system in the Ministry of health. Indicators being used for analysis are not clear and there is a narrow interpretation that services – e.g., cancer screening and primary health care – need to target men as women are already being reached;
- (ii) Sensitization training of personnel in the justice system – police, judges and lawyers – with a focus on issues of violence;
- (iii) Piloting poverty eradication strategies targeted at rural women;
- (iv) Health information and dissemination through a series of health fairs using volunteer doctors, nurses and Bureau staff. The longer term aim is community building and empowerment; and
- (v) A planned project to review all existing laws to assess their differential impact on women and men.

Planning Institute of Jamaica (PIOJ)

Using CIDA funding, author has been assigned as resource to planning to design and test with planners and related ministry and sectoral stakeholders a Gender Equity Instrument. Indicators developed would be applied to the project cycle from design to evaluation stage. Testing, as part of Phase II, should begin by November 1999.

The Centre for Gender & Development Studies (UWI) has tested, with planners from the region and UN Programme Officers, a manual on Gender in Policy & Planning.

Office of the Prime Minister (OPM): As part of the Policy Analysis & Review Unit is working to incorporate gender assessments in the policy-making process (i) at the beginning of the policy cycle where analysis is done in ministries and (ii) when policies goes to Cabinet for approval, they would have gone through another level of gender assessment at the Office of the Prime Minister.

The decision to follow this procedure has been accepted by Cabinet.

Non-Governmental Organization (NGO)

- (i) The Association of Women's Organizations of Jamaica (AWOJA) – the main umbrella organization for some 29 women's organizations has been

undergoing internal institutional stress and is now due for further transformation and strengthening. The strategy attempted for the past two years included:

- institutional strengthening particularly of member organizations which have had a “practical needs” approach to working with women;
- outreach to special groups of rural women and matching them with resource organizations (members);
- advocacy work particularly in the area of legal reform and heading the Inter-Agency campaign against violence to women.

(ii) Jamaica Women’s Political Caucus – now 7 years old – has focussed on encouraging and facilitating the participation of women in active politics. Their specific target of 40 per cent female parliamentarians did not have a time line. The target is now 25 per cent female parliamentarians by the next election – 2002; and

(iii) Women’s Arms of Political parties (3) and Fathers Incorporation have less sustained programmes, but complete the groupings where a “gender” focus, broadly speaking, can be located.

(b) Organizational Structure

Each organization mentioned above has a discreet structure. The Bureau of Women’s Affairs has the majority of established posts including two policy analysts (one vacant) and two project officers. The Social Planner at the Planning Institute and Principal Director of the Policy Analysis & Review Unit anchor structural arrangements which could most closely be described as gender mainstreaming. The structure in AWOJA has presented challenges for the Board versus the management staff that still has to be resolved. The Women’s Political Caucus operates with a three-member Management Committee, 9 member organizations including the BWA, the Centre for Gender Studies and the three political parties and 6 core individuals.

(c) Organizational Capacity

The OPM, BWA and PIOJ all recognize that capacity needs to be built in ministries and departments to do gender analysis. Given the weak capacity within the system to operationalize a gender mainstreaming process, training programmes for policy-related ministry staff for permanent secretaries and Cabinet ministers is being considered.

PIOJ is closest to testing a mechanism for institutionalizing gender analysis and planning.

(d) Stakeholder Linkages

Interest groups come together as needed. There are no sustained systemic linkages. Perceptually, government and non-governmental arms of the national machinery continue to view each other with guarded skepticism. Within the ranks of the NGOs, however, there is equally no established system for internal cohesiveness.

(e) Results

(i) Since Beijing – development agencies – CIDA, UNDP & IDB (local offices) – have show interest in either funding a strategy in gender mainstreaming, supporting the inter-agency campaign against violence and integrating gender perspective into Jamaica’s Human Development Report or updating the information on Gender Issues (1998);

(ii) Awareness and sensitization within civil society - including the judiciary – have been heightened with the public education and advocacy work of both government and non-government;

(iii) Enactment of legislation in the area of Domestic Violence is in place and public debate on the more controversial area “Sexual Harassment” continues;

(iv) Regional planners/statisticians have been trained in Gender in Policy & Planning through the initiative of the Mona campus, UWI (CGDS);

(v) Training workshops to strengthen the Household Workers Association have been held, but a leadership vacuum within the organization may render these efforts unsustainable;

(vi) A proposed Commission on Gender & Social Equity now awaits an independent review of the most desirable institutional framework. Links have been made with the South Africa model on such a Commission and a study tour has been invited;

(vii) A third political party formed in 1995 fielded the highest number of female candidates in the last general election (bringing the total to 16%), thus placing the issue of female candidature clearly in the public consciousness.

SECTION III

1. IMPACT ASSESSMENT

(a) Status of Women

(i) In all countries, the most meaningful impact on the status of women is in the area of available *legislation* and, in some countries, (Jamaica, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines) making legal aid more available to female household heads and women in need is evident;

(ii) In the area of *employment*, women in Saint Lucia, Jamaica & Montserrat have actually been losing jobs since 1995. In the first two cases, because of closure of free zone factories and, in the other, from the effect of the volcano. In St Kitts/Nevis and St Vincent and the Grenadines, the economy is growing mainly in the areas of tourism where low wage and middle management jobs become available to women. However, in Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, in spite of progressive land reform strategy over the past 15 years, young women raised in farm families have chosen to be wage earners in the capital city than to stay on the land. The target at this stage of Land Reform is, therefore, young women. Nevis, unlike St Kitts/Nevis, is reported to have more women who are independent landowners than wages earners; and

(iii) Although all countries prioritize *poverty* and recognize that poor women form the majority of the poor, no clear baselines have been set since 1995 against which interventions and impacts can be measured. Jamaica's target of reducing poverty by 30 and by the year 2000 and eradicating poverty by 2010 seems ambitious given that poverty, with gender indicators, is not integrated into the implementation process of large investment projects but is treated in a separate compartment of Government. The net effect is that poverty remains an intractable problem for countries examined and this will continue as long as treatment is offered in non-systemic, non-integrative ways.

(b) Impact on Existing Mechanism

In all the countries assessed except for Montserrat, the mechanism for women's advancement remains established and is a pivotal core of Government. There are, however, some peculiar features.

Saint Vincent and the Grenadines has approached institutional strengthening by means of upgrading the Preparatory Committee (for Beijing) to a Commission. Cabinet approval is awaited. The mechanism here appears to strengthen or weaken as key personnel are changed.

Saint Lucia plans to have a retreat by end of October to determine what qualifications the proposed Director should have and what strategy the national machinery should pursue in gender mainstreaming. Planning is recognized by the Permanent Secretary (an Economist with a planning background) as a core element in the strategy.

St Kitts/Nevis and Jamaica have both moved to strengthen their Departments/Bureaux by gaining approval for senior level posts. In *St Kitts/Nevis*, two (2) new persons will be hired and in *Jamaica* consideration may be given to equipping existing staff with technical skills so they can advance to higher level approved posts.

Montserrat is in the unique position of choosing, if it wishes, to establish a mechanism with a technical focus beyond the accustomed community services. There are, however, realistic limitations on available human resources at this time.

2. **POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS**

(i) It was expressed in some countries that UN-ECLAC could set up a desk offering countries ongoing technical assistance in gender mainstreaming rather than offering interventions related only to UN's timetable for reporting.

(ii) Development agencies in the subregion – UNFPA, UNICEF, UNDP, UNIFEM, UN-ECLAC, OAS, OECS, European Union, USAID, CARICOM Secretariat, CIDA, and Commonwealth Secretariat – need to (re)activate a formal Regional Council on gender equity with complementary areas of responsibility clearly understood. Further, countries, where models are being developed (GMS – *St Kitts/Nevis*, Gender Equity Instrument – *Jamaica*), could be given assistance in monitoring and information dissemination to make their initiatives sustainable. Agency fragmentation, at the regional level, is matched by a similar phenomenon at the national level particularly in *Jamaica*. Inter-agency coordination remains a major challenge.

(iii) Attempts made earlier by CIDA – *Barbados* – to develop a Directory of Resource persons and skills could be revisited, as the management of gender becomes an expanding industry that has no common philosophical framework. Results are not being filtered through any mechanism so that lessons learnt can be shared or the basis for re-strategizing established. The new science of Gender & Development has as many interpretations as interest groups. Strategic leadership is needed.