MIGRATION IN THE CARIBBEAN -
WHAT DO WE KNOW?

*An overview of data, policies and programmes at the international
and regional levels to address critical issues*

_____

This document has been reproduced without formal editing.

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION

Historically the nature, direction and magnitude of migration in the Caribbean have always been influenced by trends in global and regional socio-economic development. The slave trade in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries caused the first major immigration waves into the region. After Emancipation in the nineteenth century, workers began moving within the region in search of employment or better working conditions. In the twentieth century, the movement of labor to destinations within the region continued. The oil-boom in the 1970s attracted many migrants from the smaller and less developed islands to work in the oil refineries in the dependencies of the Netherlands and the United States, particularly the United States Virgin Islands, Aruba and the Netherlands Antilles. Also the booming energy sector in Trinidad and Tobago was a magnet for many in search of employment. With the global crisis in the energy sector in the 1980s the demand for labor declined and new employment opportunities were needed. The growing tourism sector in the Caribbean in the 1990s increased the demand for workers in the service sector which, in many instances, could not be supplied by the domestic labor force in some of the smaller Caribbean islands. As a consequence, workers from other islands and neighboring countries in Latin America, particularly Columbia and Venezuela, came to fill in the gaps.

With the move towards independence in the 1960s and 1970s, chances to easily move north decreased only temporarily. The growing demand for qualified labor in Northern America and, to a lesser extent in the United Kingdom, opened new windows for opportunities for the highly qualified. The United States, but also Canada and the United Kingdom, introduced legislation that favors the admission of skilled workers to fill the gaps in selected sectors of the domestic labor market which cannot be filled by nationals. As a consequence, a mass exodus of professionals, particularly skilled women in health and education has begun which threatens the already achieved accomplishments in health and education in the source countries.

This trend towards greater willingness to accept and even to promote the free movement of qualified professionals can also be observed in the Caribbean, where the Caribbean Community (CARICOM) has launched the Caribbean Single Market and Economy (CSME) in early 2005. This agreement provides for the free movement of a certain group of highly qualified nationals within the CARICOM[1] region.

With the selection and recruitment of people who meet certain predetermined profiles, chances to migrate legally have increased for a few while many semi- or unqualified laborers find it more and more difficult to legally enter the labor markets in the developed world. The global economic crisis that began in the late 1990s along with a raising demand for national security has led to more restrictive immigration regulations at most destination countries. Nevertheless, regardless of tighter border controls, the continued and growing demand for cheap labor in the formal and informal sectors in Northern America and parts of Europe have continued to attract large numbers of migrants from poorer countries. Declining revenues for the corporate sector have increased the pressure to reduce production and labor costs, thus to hire cheap man-power is for many, the first step towards maintaining or even increasing their profits.

---

[1] CARICOM member States are: Antigua and Barbuda, the Bahamas, Barbados, Belize, Dominica, Grenada, Guyana, Haiti, Jamaica, Montserrat, St. Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, St. Vincent and the Grenadines, Suriname, Trinidad and Tobago. Associate members are Anguilla, Bermuda, the British Virgin Islands, Cayman Islands and Turks and Caicos Islands.

This continued need for a low wage work force has increasingly become an incentive for illegal trafficking in human beings and unregulated and illegal employment and exploitation at the workplace. Undocumented and particularly vulnerable migrants work under unregulated conditions without access to protective recourse mechanisms and quite often in fear of being caught and deported. Consequently, a growing number of undocumented migrants in many instances are denied their basic human rights as, for example, liberty and security of person or discrimination to equal protection of the law.

In total over the last 50 years, the Caribbean, with a present population of about 37 million people (United Nations, 2003), has lost more than five million people. Based on the most recent data on migration provided by the United Nations Population Division (United Nations, 2002) the net-migration rate[2] for the Caribbean is one of the highest world-wide, with a great variation within the region itself. The countries that have experienced the greatest losses over the past decades are Guyana, Suriname, Jamaica and Saint Lucia. New trends in return migration suggest that these losses may be temporary since many migrants who spent their economically active lives in the Diaspora are returning to retire in their home countries.

The aim of this paper is to present an overview of migratory dynamics in the Caribbean and to highlight the critical challenges that various forms of migration pose to countries in this subregion. The study begins with an introduction to the framework of global and regional intergovernmental processes on migration. Chapter two provides an overview of the most recent migrant stock data for Caribbean countries. The third part of this analysis is devoted to a presentation of governments' policy responses at the national and regional level. The last part provides some insight into regional socio-economic integration mechanisms. It will elaborate on the possible impact the CSME is expected to have on the free movement of people in the region. It will further look at the interrelationship between in and out-migration and the national demographic and socio-economic development of two countries in the Caribbean for which detailed information was available, Aruba and Belize. Based on earlier research conducted by this Office, emigration of health professionals from the Caribbean will be the final topic of this chapter. The paper will conclude with a summary of the main findings of this study.

---

[2] *Net migration*: Net average number of migrants: the annual number of immigrants less the number of emigrants, including both citizens and non-citizens. *Net-migration rate*: The net number of migrants, divided by the average population of the receiving country. It is expressed as the net number of migrants per 1,000 population. Source: Population Division of the United Nations Secretariat, International Migration, Wallchart, 2002, ST/ESA/SER.A/219, Sales No. EO3.XIII.3

2. MIGRATION IN THE FRAMEWORK OF GLOBAL AND REGIONAL INTERGOVERNMENTAL PROCESSES

2.1   Migration within the United Nations systems

Globalization and the need to open markets and national economies have been promoting the free movement of goods and people. While the movement of goods is at times easier to manage than the movement of people, the movement of people is a much more delicate issue to deal with. Regardless of regulative and, at times, rather restrictive measures put in place to control cross-border movements, people have been moving and will continue to move across national borders. The fact that almost all countries worldwide are affected by such movements has given growing political relevance to this topic. Brain-drain and brain-gain, the spread of Human Immuno-deficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (HIV/AIDS), drug trafficking and terrorism along with the need to protect and safeguard the human rights of all migrants and their families are only some of the key issues that have been addressed at various international gatherings at the global and regional level convened by the United Nations system[3] in the 1990s.

Of particular importance to issues in relation to migration is the *Programme of Action (PoA)* approved by the international community at the *International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD),* held in Cairo in 1994 (United Nations, 1994) within the outcomes of United Nations global summits. This document touches on all aspects of internal and international migration and its impact on the interrelationship between population, environment and development. Further it stresses the particular efforts the international community needs to undertake to guarantee access to basic health care services, including reproductive health and family planning to migrants and, in particular, to the vulnerable group of undocumented migrants. Also in the declaration, adopted at the intergovernmental meeting to review and appraise the implementation of the Cairo Programme of Action in the Caribbean (ECLAC/CDCC, 2003a) in November 2003, governments pledged to address the challenges arising out of migration within and outside the Caribbean. Matters of concern were the smuggling and trafficking of persons, especially of women and children, the brain-drain, returning migrants, deportations, border security and the free movements of people under the provisions of the CSME.

Other summits, such as the *World Summit for Social Development* held in Copenhagen in 1995 and the *Fourth World Conference on Women* (United Nations, 1995) have integrated the movement of people and its impact on international development into their respective action programmes. The *Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development*[4] recognizes the need for intensified international cooperation and national attention to the situation of migrant workers and their families. It also addresses the needs of refugees, asylum seekers and undocumented migrants and calls on the international community for national protection and the safeguarding of the human rights of this particular vulnerable group. The Declaration further recognizes that, while the provision of basic social services to all migrants at their destination is critical for their well-being, the root causes of internal and international movements are economic pressure,

---

[3] The United Nations has played a critical role in establishing legal norms and standards in relation to international migration (see Annex 1).

[4] Report of the World Summit for Social Development, (Copenhagen, 6 – 12 March, 1995), A/Conf.166/9, 19 April 1995, Annex 1, accessible through the following web-site: http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/wssd/agreements/index.html

environmental and natural disasters along with war and political distress, and the need to be better understood in order to provide a viable livelihood at home.

The *Platform for Action* approved by the international community at the Fourth World Conference on Women convened in Beijing in 1995 and draws particular attention to the situation of female migrant workers who often encounter gender-specific obstacles with regard to exercising their rights in the labor markets of the host country. The impact of emigration of men to make a living and the consequently rising number of female-headed households in many developing countries is, through this platform, finally gaining attention at the highest level.

Various United Nations bodies and specialized agencies have consistently undertaken efforts to address migration and its causes and consequences for the sustainable development at the individual, national and global levels. While the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) undertakes efforts to combat poverty by providing food security to refugees and internally displaced people, it also supports countries in their efforts to establish sustainable livelihoods, especially in rural areas, to make staying home a viable and attractive option. The International Labor Organisation (ILO) promotes social justice and internationally recognized labor rights and helps to forge an international consensus on the protection of migrant workers from discrimination and exploitation while promoting the orderly movement of workers.

The Millennium Development Goals adopted at the Millennium Summit at United Nations Headquarters in 2000 do not specifically recognize the impact of migration on sustainable development, neither its positive impact on development through brain-gain and remittances, nor the negative consequences in the form of brain-drain, trafficking, and the spread of infectious diseases. However, the growing number of mobile people worldwide and its evident impact on development calls for inclusion of all aspects of migration into national and global development agendas.

Of importance to the international community is a resolution adopted by the General Assembly of the United Nations at its fifty-eighth session on international migration and development (A/RES/58/208) where it decides that in 2006 the General Assembly will convene a *high-level dialogue on international migration and development* (para. 9). In preparation for this event, on the occasion of the recent meeting of the Ad Hoc Committee on Population and Development, held during the thirtieth session of the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) (San Juan, Puerto Rico, 28 June-2 July 2004), member States commissioned ECLAC's Population Division Centro Latinoamericano y Caribeño de Demografía (CELADE) to prepare a document on 'Migration, Human Rights and Development' for presentation at the next meeting of the Ad Hoc Committee on Population at the thirty-first session of ECLAC in early 2006. This present study on migration in the Caribbean is intended to be integrated into the regional background document to specifically reflect Caribbean aspects of migration.

To respond to the need for high-level consultations on this matter in the Latin America and Caribbean region, two initiatives have gained critical importance: First, the *Puebla Process* which was initiated in 1996 in Puebla, Mexico, with the objective of reducing irregular migration particularly with respect to the transit of irregular migrants from outside the region through Central America and Mexico to North America. Second, in November 2002, the CELADE organized, in collaboration with the International Organization of Migration (IOM), in Chile from 20-22 November 2002 the *'Hemispheric Conference on Migration: Human Rights and*

Trafficking in Persons in the Americas'. The objective of the conference[5] was to strengthen cooperation among governments in the field of international migration; to help to identify mechanisms for protecting and promoting human rights of migrants; and to combat and prevent the trafficking in humans[6]. The officials present acknowledged the existence of a number of international instruments for the protection of human rights of migrants and the prevention of trafficking in persons and were encouraged to consider ratification of these instruments as well as implementation of those ratified to date.

2.2   Globalisation, integration and trade liberalization

The process of globalization has led to the establishment of a series of global and regional trade liberalization agreements which affect, either directly or indirectly, the economic and social development of the Caribbean Small Island Developing States (SIDS). Within the wider Americas as well as with key trade partners in Europe, a series of regional, subregional and bilateral free trade agreements (FTAs), such as the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), the Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR), the Central American Common Market (CACM) and the CSME within CARICOM, were signed or are being negotiated.

While the majority of such trade agreements determine in much detail the rules and regulations for the exchange of goods, trade in services is quite often only marginally considered and only short-term (generally less than a year) migration is addressed. This is understandable since such trade differs considerably in its nature from trade in goods in a sense that most service transactions require proximity between producers and consumers and thus imply that either consumer or producer change location for the transaction to go forward, requiring cross-border transactions as well as labor movements as forms of delivery. In various degrees, all of these agreements cover trade in services which includes the consideration of the free movement of persons, one of the most important areas of interest for developing countries.

However, in reality none of them goes much further than the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)[7], which provides a regulative framework for services trade. The GATS regulatory framework only speaks to temporary movements of highly qualified labor while low- and unskilled labor migration as well as long-term migration (over three months) are not included. Not surprising, since rules and regulations regarding the temporary or permanent admission of foreigners vary significantly from country to country and, dependent on present economic interests, labor market demands and national security concerns, governments are rather reluctant to hand authority over immigration to regional or even subregional bodies.

2.2.1   The Caribbean Single Market and Economy

---

[5] United Nations General Assembly Resolution A/56/203, ECLAC resolutions 590 (XXIX) and 592 (XXIX). More information on the conference can be found at the following web-site: http://www.eclac.cl/celade/.

[6] The full conference report, titled: Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC), International Organization for Migration (IOM, Hemispheric Conference on International Migration: Human Rights and Trafficking in Persons in the Americas, Santiago, Chile, 20-22 November 2002, Report, Conference Room Paper DSC/1, 2002, can be downloaded from: http://www.eclac.cl/celade/noticias/noticias/5/13215/InformeCH_ING.pdf

[7] For more information on the GATS rules and regulation please refer to the WTO/GATS Website: www.WTO.org. The WHO-website also provides further material on trade in services with a particular reference to trade in health services.

Of particular interest to this region is the evolution of the CSME, which was established in 1989 by the Heads of Government of CARICOM through the Grand Anse Declaration[8] with the intention of deepening their integration process and strengthening the Caribbean Community in all its dimensions. One of the main pillars of the CSME is the commitment to liberalize the movement of labor and to abolish the need for work permits for nationals from CSME participating countries. To facilitate its implementation, this free movement initiative was modified several times since its adoption to reach an agreement on a phased implementation. This phased approach with the ultimate goal of reaching free movement for all has so far agreed on the following[9]:

Free Movements of University Graduates:

So far (as of July 2005) 11 member States, with the exception of Montserrat and Suriname, have enacted legislation to give effect to this mandate. This implies that university graduates are able to work in the 11 countries without the need for work permits.

Free movement of artists, sports persons, musicians and media workers:

In July 1992 the categories of persons allowed to move freely for work purposes was expanded to include artists, sports persons, musicians and media workers. The legal framework to allow for the free movement of these categories has been amended and is now fully operational in the following eight member States: Belize, Dominica, Grenada, Guyana, Jamaica, Saint Lucia, St. Vincent and the Grenadines and Trinidad and Tobago. St. Kitts and Nevis and Suriname have begun to partly implement the free movement initiative for professionals.

Free movement of the 'Protocol II categories':

Protocol II provides for the free movement of non-wage earners, either as service providers and/or to establish businesses, including managerial, supervisory and technical staff, and their spouses and immediate family members. None of the member States has so far adopted any legal framework to allow the free movement of such persons.

CARICOM Agreement on Social Security:

The CARICOM Agreement on Social Security, which came into effect on 1 April 1997, is to be considered a supportive measure for the free movement of people in the region. To implement this agreement, almost all the CSME member States (with the exception of Grenada and Suriname[10]) have already enacted domestic legislation. To enhance adherence in the region, the CARICOM associate members and observer countries[11] were invited to accede to the Agreement in 1998, but none has so far signed or ratified it.

---

[8] Quote Anse Declaration, CSME et al. ….
[9] Reference is made to the Status of the Free Movement of Skills and the CARICOM Social Security Agreement as of October 2002 (http://www.caricom.org/expframes2.htm)
[10] Grenada has already signed and ratified the protocol, whereas Suriname currently does not have a security system which is similar to that of other member states.
[11] Anguilla, British Virgin Islands, Turks and Caicos Islands.

3. MIGRATION IN THE CARIBBEAN – WHAT DO WE KNOW?

3.1 Measuring migration - a global challenge

With globally growing numbers of people on the move, either caused by politically unstable environments in search of a safe livelihood or 'simply' for economic reasons for the survival of one's self and family, the issue of migration has gained greater importance on the political agendas of many source and destination countries. In order to be able to address the main causes of emigration as well as to deal with the needs of immigrants in the receiving countries, timely quantitative and qualitative data on migrant streams are indispensable. Various efforts undertaken to monitor migratory movements at the national and international level are by far incomplete and more needs to be done to assess the specific causes for and the implications of emigration and immigration. Most countries allow for the free movement of their citizens across national borders but apply rigorous mechanisms to control the inflow of people of foreign descent. Hence generally more information is available on immigration than on emigration. The main sources for data on cross-border movements are border statistics, population censuses and household surveys along with various administrative registers, with the latter quite often only providing information on specific professionals who need to register or pass an exam to be granted a work-permit or a license in the host country. However data from different sources are generally not fully compatible since various sources apply different definitions and concepts of what constitutes a migrant and often cover different time periods. With this in mind it becomes clear that, worldwide, no country is yet in a position to provide a complete account of the in- and outflow of people across its borders.

While flow data are even harder to get, stock-data (balance of immigration and emigration) as published by the Population Division of the United Nations are available for most countries that conduct population censuses on a regular basis. However, in countries with limited data collection and analysis capacity, as is the case for many Caribbean countries, the information available is quite often outdated and does not adequately reflect the situation at present. In the case of the Caribbean SIDS, which are in their majority affected by both flows, the stock data as the balance between in –and outflow of migrants is of little value for monitoring purposes since, quite often, considerable numbers of people moving in both directions is not reflected in these statistics

Efforts to measure international migration have also been hampered by the fact that no agreement has yet been reached at the global or even regional or subregional levels with regard to a common concept to define international migration (United Nations, 2002). This lack of consistency and conformity seems to be one of the greatest obstacles to obtaining accurate measurements. Many countries, in fact, apply their own definitions when collecting data and hardly make any adjustments to allow for international comparability. While some consider nationality as the decisive factor in defining a person as a migrant, others use variable concepts of residency. In order to take into account duration, the United Nations (1998) has recommended the definition of a long-term migrant as a person who moves to a country other than his origin or residence for a duration of more than 12 months', whereas a short-term migrant is a person who migrates for between three and 12 months.

In summary, the diversity of concepts and definitions applied by countries, research institutions and international organizations to measure migration and the rather narrow range of empirical evidence available continue to challenge not only demographers and population experts but, more so, policy planers and politicians who have to respond to these growing challenges.

3.2   Levels and trends in intraregional and international migration in the Caribbean

3.2.1   Migration within the Caribbean subregion

For many people in the Caribbean, the search for a better life has quite often begun within the region. This has become evident through the fact that the absolute number of foreign-born nationals originating in the Caribbean present in another country in the subregion has steadily increased over the last two decades. Migrant stock data published by the United Nations (United Nations 2002) (see Table 1 below) confirm these trends. The data show clearly that the number of migrants has increased in the Caribbean. While the absolute migrant stock is comparatively small in the Caribbean, the migrant stock as percentage of the population is considerably high. According to the data available, on average, about 3% of the Caribbean population can be considered migrants. This, however, varies considerably from country to country, with the lowest percentage found in Jamaica, Guyana, Cuba and the Dominican Republic and the highest proportions reported for the British Virgin Islands, the Cayman Islands, Anguilla, the Netherlands Antilles, Aruba and the United States Virgin Islands. The majority of migrants originate in just a few countries, mainly in the smaller member States of the Organisation of Eastern Caribbean States (OECS), with the exception of Anguilla, but also Jamaica, Guyana, Suriname and Haiti. Deteriorating economic and social conditions, high unemployment particularly for younger people and little hope for improvements in the foreseeable future constitute the main push factors for those desperate to leave.

Table 1: DATA ON POPULATION AND MIGRATION FROM THE 2000 REVISION OF WORLD POPULATION PROSPECTS. DATA ON REFUGEES FROM UNHCR (Revised 10 September 2002)						
	Population (thousands)		Migrant stock (thousands)		As percentage of population	
Country or area	1990	2000	1990	2000	1990	2000
World	5,254,820	6,056,715	153,956	174,664	2.93	2.88
More developed regions	1,148,365	1,191,429	81,424	104,119	7.09	8.74
Less developed regions	4,106,455	4,865,286	72,531	70,545	1.77	1.45
Least developed countries	514,605	667,613	10,992	10,458		
Latin America and the Caribbean	440,354	518,809	6,994	5,914	1.59	1.14
Caribbean	33,907	37,941	909	1,071	2.68	2.82
Anguilla	8	11	2	4	27.97	35.61
Antigua and Barbuda	63	65	12	16	19.18	24.47
Aruba	66	101	14	31	21.91	30.83
Bahamas	255	304	27	30	10.52	9.85
Barbados	257	267	21	25	8.32	9.16
British Virgin Islands	17	24	8	8	44.03	35.49
Cayman Islands	26	38	13	15	48.89	39.12
Cuba	10,629	11,199	100	82	0.94	0.73
Dominica	71	71	3	4	3.53	5.28
Dominican Republic	7,061	8,373	103	136	1.46	1.63
Grenada	91	94	4	8	4.70	8.50
Guadeloupe	391	428	66	83	16.88	19.44
Haiti	6,907	8,142	19	26	0.28	0.32
Jamaica	2,369	2,576	17	13	0.73	0.49
Martinique	360	383	39	54	10.74	14.21
Montserrat	11	4	2	0	18.76	4.86
Netherlands Antilles	188	215	38	55	20.48	25.35
Puerto Rico	3,528	3,915	322	383	9.14	9.79
St. Kitts and Nevis	42	38	4	4	9.64	11.19
Saint Lucia	131	148	5	8	4.06	5.45
St. Vincent and the Grenadines	106	113	4	8	3.79	6.66
Trinidad and Tobago	1,215	1,294	51	41	4.16	3.20
Turks and Caicos Islands	12	17	2	3	18.33	16.23
United States Virgin Islands	104	121	31	35	30.22	28.79
Central America	111,409	135,129	1,836	1,040	1.65	0.77
Belize	186	226	45	17	24.40	7.51
South America	295,037	345,738	4,250	3,803	1.44	1.10
Guyana	731	761	3	2	0.43	0.21
Suriname	402	417	9	6	2.13	1.49

Source: United Nations Population Division (2002)

A study initiated by this office (ECLAC/CDCC, 1998) to analyze the causes of migration and its impact on the receiving countries in the Caribbean found that immigration has tremendous impacts on the life of the national population of the receiving country. Another study (Oakes, 1992) on the situation of migrant workers in the British Virgin Islands portrays the implications

that the work-permit system has on the migrant and his legal status in that country. With the exception of a few naturalized citizens, most immigrants remain temporary workers for their entire stay and this holds even for those 'temporary' migrants, who have lived in the host country over extended periods of time (sometimes 15 years and longer). Being 'temporary' implies being subject to deportation at any given time and to have no access to basic health-care services and education for children.

A recent study (Mills, 2004) has critically analyzed possible consequences of the free movement of labor within the CSME and raises questions concerning its impact on the value of citizenship, sovereignty and nationality of independent Caribbean States. The paper suggests that these concerns would need to be further discussed to build common grounds and mutual understanding and support for this envisaged regional integration of presently independent and sovereign States. It also further points to a potential risk in so far as cheap labor migrants might compete with nationals for the same jobs, and would even accept work under less favorable conditions with the implication of decreasing wage and benefit levels for all on the long term. Another concern is the various languages spoken by immigrants and nationals. Seemingly, this has been affecting particularly the British Virgin Islands with a considerable number of Spanish-speaking migrants from the Dominican Republic and the use of Patois by Haitians in the Bahamas.

Regardless of the anxiety raised by many regarding a further move towards regional integration and the increased free movements of people within these countries, it is expected that the absolute number of foreign-born nationals living in the Caribbean countries will continue to grow in the foreseeable future.

In response to the needs of migrants, governments in the Caribbean have undertaken various efforts to provide access to basic social services, such as reproductive health and education services to migrants in their countries. For example the Bahamas, Antigua and Barbuda as well as Suriname have begun language training for their health and social workers in order to communicate with migrants from non-English speaking countries. However in spite of the efforts undertaken to improve apart from living and working conditions for migrants, a particular challenge faced is the supply of basic social and health services to undocumented migrants who in fear of being expelled quite often hide in inaccessible squatters and illegal settlements.

3.2.2 Extraregional migration and its impact on the Caribbean

In their search for higher wages and better employment, skilled professionals are on the move worldwide. Caribbean countries like Jamaica, Cuba and Trinidad and Tobago are strong exporters of qualified labor, particularly teachers, nurses and other health professionals. Family ties, geographic proximity and the use of the same language make the United States and Canada and, to a lesser extent, the United Kingdom a preferred destination for migrants from the Caribbean. Increasing job opportunities in certain sectors of the labor market along with the hope of a prosperous life make moving north an attractive option for many Caribbean nationals. Based on data provided by the United States Bureau of the Census[12], of all foreign nationals living in the United States, 10 per cent are of Caribbean origin with the majority coming from Cuba (34 per

---

[12] Immigration Statistics were retrieved in April 2003 from the following web-site of the Department of Homeland Security in the United States:
http://www.immigration.gov/graphics/shared/aboutus/statistics/index.htm

cent) and the Dominican Republic (25 per cent) and more than 10 per cent are from Haiti and Jamaica. Of all migrants from South America, each 10th is originally from Guyana[13].

Whereas some governments favor the exodus of their skilled in exchange for desired remittances to boost their economies, many countries suffer tremendous constraints in their capacities to provide equal, qualitative and affordable social services to their populations. Worse, the continued depletion of professionals deprives the region of its desperately needed qualified staff whose education and training were often a considerable expense to its taxpayers. Since qualified professionals play a critical role in sustainable development, this continuous loss threatens to paralyze progress underway in the economic and social sectors in the region. Therefore more needs to be done to alleviate the impact of the brain drain and to provide for attractive options at home for those who would otherwise seek greener pastures abroad. Research has shown that, for example, in the case of health workers an improvement in pay and working conditions could act as an incentive to stay. A raise in pensions, better child care, educational opportunities and recognition of the profession are also known to be important (WHO, 2002). With the negative consequences of the brain drain becoming more severe, the understanding in the developed world that the negative impact of a severe shortage of professionals in the developing world has begun to hamper global development efforts.

Significant progress in addressing the brain-drain in the health-sector has been made in the United Kingdom where, in 2001, a Code of Practice[14] for ethical recruitment was put in place by its National Health Service. France has reached an agreement with the Maghreb countries to regulate the export of health professionals. South Africa has signed a pact with members of the South African Development Community (SADC), vowing not to hire health professionals from other SADC member States.

To contribute to the better understanding of the impact of the brain-drain on the public health system in the Caribbean and to assist the governments to develop policies to improve the situation, ECLAC has conducted a case-study on Trinidad and Tobago to assess the causes and consequences of the emigration of nurses from the Caribbean (ECLAC/CDCC 2003b). (See chapter V.3.3)

3.2.3 Remittances and other socio-economic benefits of emigration

Remittances and in-kind contributions sent by migrants provide important benefits to the immediate family members as well as to the national economy back home. Countries like Jamaica, the Dominican Republic and Haiti are among those that benefit worldwide most from the remittances received (UNCTAD, 2003). However, the measurement of remittances is extremely imprecise and the value of the flows of non-monetary goods has to be estimated in most cases. Since many Caribbean migrants do not have bank accounts, a significant amount of these flows moves unrecorded through informal channels. To increase the flow of in-cash remittances some countries have undertaken efforts to facilitate the transfer of monies by

---

[13] The regional grouping applied by the Census Bureau differs from that applied by ECLAC in so far as Guyana and Suriname are part of South America, while ECLAC includes these two countries to the Caribbean.

[14] The *Code of Practice for NHS Employers involved in the International Recruitment of Healthcare Professionals* was published in October 2001 to provide NHS employers with a more detailed explanation of the processes to be undertaken when recruiting internationally. More information is available on the Department of Health website: http://www.doh.gov.uk/international-recruitment/agencycode.htm

establishing remittance service companies (e.g. Western Union, Remittance Express, etc.) and by making efforts to negotiate lower fares charged for such services.

Apart from mere economic benefits, countries also profit from a wider array of returns. For example, health and education facilities have been strengthened through people-to people partnerships. Overseas based nationals, school alumni and professionals contribute time, technical assistance and equipment to support population and development services in their home countries. For example, teams of Jamaican physicians in the Diaspora periodically visit to perform operations, or donate much-needed equipment and supplies to support the health system back home. Similarly alumni of teachers' colleges provide scholarships for students. Last, but not least, Caribbean tourism revenues have also grown through these and other networks of nationals in the Diaspora.

Regardless of the efforts already undertaken, more research is needed to gain insight into the flow of resources to better understand the flow of remittances. It cannot be assumed that all migrants remit to the same extent. While male migrants with dependants back home generally remit more and more regularly, young professional women with neither children nor spouse most probably will remit much less. Also, the growing numbers of people who have indebted themselves by using the assistance of traffickers will be less in a position to remit much, at least until their debts will be paid off.

3.2.4 Irregular migration and the trafficking of humans

The magnitude of undocumented migration remains difficult to quantify and consequently the true dimension of this phenomenon is impossible to assess. It is widely believed that undocumented migration is on the rise, mostly as an outcome of increasingly restrictive admission policies in receiving countries in the developed world and social and economic instability combined with the occurrence of natural disasters and rising poverty levels in many less developed countries. As indicated earlier, the growing need for cheap labor in the northern hemisphere and at times the lax law-enforcement mechanisms against trafficking in many parts of the world are increasingly turning Caribbean countries into a thriving environment for this often rather lucrative business. Prostitution and trade in women and girls as sex-workers to tourist destinations in the region and also abroad have created a further market for undocumented labor world-wide.

Recent research on irregular migration in the Caribbean (Thomas-Hope, 2002) has shown that basically two groups of migrants are currently a matter of serious concern to the subregion. The first group consists of migrants who enter a country illegally, who over-extend their stay beyond the limits of their visas or whose residence or citizenship status has been altered due to changes in the legal framework. This also includes women and girls who are trafficked as commercial sex-workers mainly from the Dominican Republic to tourist destinations within the region and to major cities in North America and Europe. The second group includes deportees, who are involuntarily repatriated to their home country following a conviction of a criminal or civil offense. For example, in the four years between 1994 and 1998, 22,397 persons were deported from North America and the United Kingdom to the Caribbean. Many of these deportees have left their country of birth at ayoung age many years before their forced repatriation and therefore do not have any family or community network to help with their reintegration. In addition, to deportations to countries offering little opportunities to make a living quickly provide new clients to organized gangs of traffickers who offer their services to facilitate the move back to the country where the deportation originated.

4. GOVERNMENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF AND POLICIES ON MIGRATION

Over the past decades policies in the area of labor migration have evolved along four major paths (United Nations, 2002, p. 20): growing restrictiveness in the admission of labor migrants in developed countries; a significant increase in developing countries that became host to foreign workers; the rising recognition that the rights of migrant workers and their families need to be protected; and the adoption of regional agreements on the free movement of persons.

The following paragraphs intend to provide a brief overview of the perception of various aspects of migration at the national level. It will also give a summary of policies adopted to address these issues. The focus is on national policies to manage migration flows to and from a given country. The data presented are provided by the United Nations Population Division[15] which, within the United Nations, has the mandate to monitor population policies at the global level.

When monitoring of population policies began in 1976, migration was not a top priority for most countries worldwide. However, over the last decades this view has changed and a growing number of countries has begun to recognize the importance of monitoring and managing migration.

4.1 General views and policies on migration

Caribbean countries are source, transit or final destination. How Caribbean governments view and address the in- and outflow of people to and from their country is reflected in the following table (Table 2).

Based on the information available for two points in time over a five-year period (1996 and 2000), only five out of 16 countries (Antigua and Barbuda, the Bahamas, Belize, the Dominican Republic and Suriname) report in 2000 that they perceive immigration as too high and, in total, six countries report that they wish to lower the inflow of non-nationals. While immigration seems to only affect a selected few countries, the loss of their people and its consequences appears to impact on the majority of Caribbean nations. This view was expressed by nine out of 16 countries in 1996 and six out of 16 countries in 2000. These views and the policies adopted seem to be a response to the pressing realities in the respective countries (see Table 1 on the migrant stock data).

A look at the views and policies adopted by the main destinations for Caribbean migrants in North America reveals that the United States and Canada are favouring immigration, while the United Kingdom perceives the inflow of foreign nationals too high and reports that it has begun to limit immigration.

---

[15] Mainly two documents: United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division, International Migration Report 2002, New York, ST/ESA/SER.A/220; United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division; World Population Policies 2003, New York, ST/ESA/SER.A/230.

Table 2: Governments views and policies on immigration and emigration, 1996 and 2000 (number of countries)

Year	Views			Policies			
	satisfactory	*too high*	*Total*	*maintain*	*no intervention*	*lower*	*total*
CARIBBEAN							
IMMIGRATION							
1996	12	4	16	8	1	6	15
2000	11	5[1]	16	7	1	8	16
EMIGRATION							
1996	7	9	16	3	6	7	16
2000	10	6	16	2	10	4	16
DEVELOPED COUNTRIES[1]							
IMMIGRATION							
1996	2	1	3	1	-	2	3
2000	2	1	3	2		1	3

1= United States, Canada, United Kingdom, Netherlands

4.2   Labor migration and immigration of family members

With regard to the readiness to allow family members of migrants to join, the greater part of the countries in this region seems to want to restrict the further inflow of dependants of already recognized migrants. This is most probably a consequence of increasing demands of family members to be granted access to rather costly basic social services, such as health care and education in the host country.

4.3   Integration of migrants

According to the information available, Caribbean countries seem to be generally rather reluctant to integrate foreign migrants into their societies. Only three (Dominica, Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago) out of 10 countries have reported efforts to promote the integration of non-nationals. Similar levels of resistance were expressed towards permanent settlements of non-nationals, with four countries planning to reduce permanent immigration while two countries, Cuba and Guyana, want to maintain the present level of permanent settlements of foreign migrants.

The two main destinations for Caribbean migrants, Canada and the United States support the integration of non-nationals in their countries and have also expressed a desire to maintain present levels of permanent settlements. The United Kingdom is taking a more protective stance by favoring the integration of those already in the country but opposing a further increase in the intake of additional immigrants.

5. NATIONAL PERSPECTIVES AND INITIATIVES
TO ADDRESS MIGRATION

5.1   National concerns on migration – Overview

After a global overview of trends in government views and policies on migration, this section will provide some insight into mechanisms designed at the national level to address migration. Some countries have found successful strategies to ease the pressure on their domestic labor markets by identifying employment opportunities for their nationals abroad. Saint Lucia and St. Vincent and the Grenadines are supporting recruitment drives by the British Government for the enlistment of their young males into the British Armed Forces. Of a more temporary nature are agreements between Jamaica and Saint Lucia with Canada and the United States on the seasonal provision of farm-workers. Jamaica's tourism sector initiative is playing a critical role in facilitating temporary movements of labor abroad and programmes have been established by the Ministry of Education to train hotel workers for employment in international labor markets. To encourage the return of qualified nationals and to provide opportunities for retirees to spend the 'golden years' back home, various initiatives are underway. Tax breaks and investment opportunities along with economic citizenship programmes are used as incentives to attract foreign investment capital either through returning retirees or business people from the region and/or through foreign direct investment in the private sector. Several such programmes are being put in place in Barbados, Jamaica, Belize and Grenada. Jamaica even goes a step further to promote return migration of the skilled and their integration through an IOM supported programme which matches skills available in the Diaspora with open vacancies back home.

While some countries have identified areas where they can benefit from in- and out migration, others have struggled over the past decades with the negative side effects. The majority of the countries in the subregion, St. Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, St. Vincent and the Grenadines along with Guyana and Trinidad and Tobago, have been losing a considerable number of their professionals in health and education. To address the brain drain, governments have begun to undertake efforts to develop policies and programmes to create and promote attractive career opportunities for their young and successful professionals. An example par excellence is a joint initiative undertaken by the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO) and CARICOM to encourage nurses to stay and to promote Caribbean nurses in the Diaspora to return (ECLAC/CDCC, 2003). At a recent conference on the movement of nurses in the Caribbean organized by the Commonwealth Secretariat in Barbados, a Draft Framework of Action was designed to explore ways to manage migration of nurses more efficiently[16]. An area of growing concern for the entire region is the increase in human trafficking and deportations. While the trafficking of humans is not an unknown phenomenon for most countries, relatively new are the rising numbers of deportees[17] call for the establishment of policies and programmes to cope with those who were deported on their own with no existing network of families and friends. Quite often young men, but increasingly also young women, are being deported as a consequence of a criminal conviction or any other collision with the law. Many of these deportees have left their country of origin a long time ago or even as early as during their childhood and consequently do not have any social or cultural ties. With their numbers rising, deportees are quite often stigmatized and made responsible for raising crime levels and petty cash criminality. However, in

---

[16] The Commonwealth Secretariat also launched a study to assess possible avenues to manage temporary migration of nurses and teachers successfully. (Commonwealth Secretariat , A manage temporary movement programme for teachers and nurses, Barbados, 2005).

[17] Forced return migration happens when an adult, regardless of their 'connection' with their country of origin' is being expelled and forcefully returned by the recipient country.

spite of these new trends, governments are rather reluctant to take action to cope with this challenge and only a few and small non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are facilitating the reintegration of deportees at present.

A matter of growing concern for most countries in the Caribbean is undocumented migration and the trafficking of humans, particularly of young women and girls to tourist destinations within and also outside the Caribbean. To address the need for protection of female migrants, the Dominican Republic has established an inter-institutional committee and has also put in place a shelter for returned women who were trafficked to and from the Dominican Republic. To manage the uncontrolled inflow of undocumented labor migrants from Haiti, the Bahamas has initiated dialogue with the Government of Haiti to agree on a limited number of Haitian workers to fill specific gaps in their labor market. With the assistance of the IOM, Cuba and the United States have agreed upon a Tripartite Memorandum of Understanding to regulate the treatment of Haitian refugees whose voyage to the United States quite often ends accidentally on the Cuban coast. To assess the scope of undocumented migrants and refugees in its country, Belize has launched an Amnesty Programme in 1999 for all its undocumented residents. (For more on Belize see Chapter 5.3.2). Caribbean countries on the South American continent, are increasingly complaining about the inflow of irregular migrant workers from neighboring countries who seek work in the resource based industries, such as the gold mines in Suriname.

5.2   Return migration and retention of the skilled

With the ageing of Caribbean migrants in the Diaspora and these growing numbers planning to retire back home, the need to address return migration and reintegration of older migrants has become more urgent. Quite a few of those retirees are economically well off and would be willing to invest in the region, provided that lucrative investment opportunities are being offered. The latter could provide many countries with additional revenues but, until today, only less than a handful of governments in the region have recognized this new potential.

5.3   Country studies

5.3.1   Double or Quits – A study on recent migration to Aruba 1993 – 2003

Socio-economic overview
Tourism is the mainstay of the small, open Aruban economy along with offshore banking and oil refining. The rapid growth of the tourism sector over the last decade has resulted in a substantial expansion of other activities. Construction has boomed, with hotel capacity in 2000 five times the level of 1985. In addition, the reopening of the country's oil refinery in 1993, a major source of employment and foreign exchange earnings, has further spurred economic growth. Aruba's small domestic labor force is not in a position to meet the growing demands of the labor market for more workers. Consequently, despite sharp increases in wages, many positions remain vacant. To fill these gaps, labor from abroad has become indispensable.

Aruba, with an estimated one third of its population being foreign born, is one of the countries in the Caribbean with the highest percentage of migrants (see Table 1). While the economy is dependent on the influx of foreign workers, the impact on the socio-demographic structure of the population has become a matter of serious concern. In 2003, The Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS) of Aruba undertook an in-depth analysis to assess the situation of migrants. The results of this assessment are published in a study entitled 'Doubles or Quits' which is a

quantitative and qualitative evaluation of the living conditions of migrants that have come to Aruba over the last decade.

Main findings of the study

Demographics

An interesting finding of the study is the fact that source countries for immigrants are no longer only neighboring Dutch islands or the Netherlands, but increasingly Latin America and other Caribbean islands. The study shows that the main sending countries for migrants are Colombia and Venezuela in Latin America, and the Netherlands Antilles and the Dominican Republic in the Caribbean. Only one third of the foreign born population today originates in the Netherlands.

While the majority of the male migrants, who are generally occupying higher qualified jobs, are of Dutch origin, most of the female migrants come from neighboring countries in Latin America and are filling in for less qualified jobs in the service sector, particularly in tourism and domestic services. According to the most recent census data, over the past 10 years more women than men found their way to Aruba. It was further found that the majority of all migrants have already had friends and/or family (67 per cent) in the country prior to arrival, a fact that facilitates access to housing and entrance into the labor market. The existence of social and family networks also makes it more understandable that the greater part of foreigners came to Aruba with the intension of settling down permanently.

Intermarriages between migrants and Aruban nationals have become a rather common phenomenon in the country with a growing number of mixed couples (more than 50 per cent of all marriages). A study undertaken by the CBS based on census data, found that a larger share of Aruban men marries foreign women while Aruban women to a far lesser extent seem to select men from abroad. The fact that considerably more female than male migrants who come to Aruba are single might provide an explanation for this phenomenon. While marriages between Aruban women and foreign men are generally accepted, the opposite seems not to be the case. This might be so since Aruban women tend to prefer men from developed countries, since such a marriage is considered a move up on the social echelon, while the case of Aruban men marrying foreign women (mainly women from Latin America) is only reluctantly accepted. Further, a closer look at the age and sex distribution of the native Aruban population points to a gender bias towards women in almost all age-groups between ages 20 – 49, which makes it even more difficult for Aruban women to find a partner, while opportunities for Aruban men improve. The imbalance on the marriage market is, in demographic terms, "marriage squeeze", an experience which particularly Aruban women undergo and is reflected in the various ways marriages between national women and foreign men, on the one hand, are positively sanctioned, while this cannot be said for the opposite, when the husband is Aruban and the wife, a 'Mamasita[18]', is a foreigner. The study reports that Mamasitas are accused of being 'seducers' of Aruban men, luring them into marriage, regardless of their marital status, educational background or age in order to get their work permits and/or Dutch nationality.

In response to the question why female migrants selected Aruban nationals, various motives such as emotional and sexual attraction, but also economic reasons and motives related to legal status and immigration were listed.

---

[18] 'Mamasitas' is a general term used for women from Latin America who is actively looking for a husband in order to obtain the necessary permits and/or the Dutch nationality.

Legal status of migrants

Undocumented migration is a matter of serious concern for the Government of Aruba. While after a period of time most migrants obtain legal status, a large number initially enters the country either as an undocumented migrant or simply overstays a tourist or visitors visa. About two thirds of the migrants interviewed report to have spent at least six months in Aruba without proper immigration documents, but the majority of all migrants (64 per cent) has been awarded residency within the first 12 months of their stay and after three years only eight per cent were still not legalized. The fact that the majority of the migrants seem to have entered the country as undocumented migrants and yet have a good chance to gain citizenship can be taken as an indication of the desperate need for foreign labor in the country.

Labor market

In response to the question why they came to Aruba, the majority of the migrants answered that they intended to settle permanently. However, this is only possible given the fact that immigration is an option and the labor market provides sufficient opportunities for those who come. The study found that migrants who came to Aruba started to work as soon as possible and almost one third of those who came had already a job offer prior to their arrival. An interesting finding is the fact that more men than women from developed countries and more women than men from developing countries had a job waiting for them upon arrival. Particularly those migrants from developing countries with a job offer benefited from an already existing network of family and friends who provided the necessary contacts and help to find employment. Among the group that started to seek employment after arrival, the vast majority succeeded fairly quickly in finding work. After two months, 50 per cent of the men and almost 40 per cent of the women had found a job. After six months less than one fifth of all men were still unemployed but more than one third of all women were without a job. In total over the past nine years approximately 12,700 jobs were added and natives could only contribute to a limited extent (10.8 per cent) to the growing labor force. With the tourist sector booming, the majority of the migrants from developing countries are employed in hotels and restaurants, also in 'whole sales' and construction. Foreigners from the developed world in their greater part provide highly skilled labor and occupy positions in real estate, renting and business activities as well as in public administration, defense and social security. With regard to working hours and pay, the general notion is that women from Latin America work the longest hours and seem to be drawing the smallest salaries of all foreign workers in the country.

Remittances

Remitting money home is important for most foreign laborers in Aruba. More than half of all migrant men and women remit money on a regular basis, quite often even on a monthly basis. Most of the money is sent to parents or children to cover education costs and medical bills.

Integration

Integration into a new society has various dimensions beginning with acquiring the national language to be granted citizenship. With the majority of Arubans speaking several languages (Papiamento, Dutch, Spanish and English) and most migrants from Latin America quickly acquiring Papiamento, language seems to be less a barrier to integration than in other parts of the world. While generally mixed marriages enhance intercultural exchanges and integration into the new society, the study has shown that migrant men seem to feel more

accepted and less discriminated against than women. In spite of this about 87 per cent of male and 79 per cent of female migrants state that it is easy to integrate into the Aruban society and the vast majority of all migrants seem to be content with their life.

The final formal step towards integration and naturalization was considerably easy to accomplish until the recent past when requests for naturalization were generally granted within a year's time. However the situation has begun to change with decreasing numbers of granted requests for naturalization and generally longer waiting times for those who apply.

5.3.2   The impact of migration on the socio-economic and ethnic stratification of Belize

The demography of this most sparsely populated nation in Central America has been greatly affected by various immigration streams over the past centuries and even more so, since its independence in the early 1980s. Immigration and, to a lesser extent, emigration have transformed the socio-ethnic composition of the population significantly. Consequently, in spite of generally declining fertility rates over the past 20 years the population of Belize grew from approximately 145,000 people to an estimated 240,000 people.

In the early 1980s, Belize became a safe haven for people from Central American countries such as Guatemala, El Salvador and Honduras in search of security for those who fled the civil war or who were on the look-out for economic opportunities. With very little formal education in many cases, these migrants moved mainly into the rural communities to work in the agricultural sector. According to the 1991 population census, approximately 30,000 to 40,000 immigrants were living in Belize, while other sources have quoted a total of over 60,000 immigrants, representing about one fifth of the total population. Estimates based on the 2002 Census are more conservative and suggest that about 15 per cent of the entire population in the country is of foreign origin.

The continued influx of Spanish-speaking Mestizos has shifted the ethnic composition of the population. According to 1980 Census figures over the following 10 years Mestizos contributed an estimated 30 per cent to the national population which grew by about 50 per cent to a high of 44 per cent in 1990. Over the same period, the English-speaking Creoles experienced a serious drop from a recording of 39.7 percent in 1980 to less than one third only 10 years later. Other, by far less numerous, ethnic groups that live in Belize are Mayas, Garifuna and Hindu.

These far reaching changes in the ethnic composition of the population can only be partly attributed to immigration. Of greater importance than actual large immigration flows are the significantly higher fertility rates of Belize's foreign born population. While fertility rates for the entire country seem to have continuously declined over the past decades, fertility patterns for distinct ethnic groups vary significantly. Data derived from the 1980 and 1991 censuses show for the entire population declining Total Fertility Rates (TFR) of 6.0 and 4.7, respectively. These findings are also confirmed by survey data for the mid-1990s that point at a further decline with about three children born to each woman in 1995 (Arias Foundation, 2000). A closer look at fertility data by ethnicity reveals considerable variations with higher fertility for foreign-born mothers, who seem to have on the average 1.4 children more than native women (see Table 3 below). The highest fertility rates are found for women from Central America where most of the migrants originate. The following table shows the fertility rate broken down by country of origin:

Table 3
Fertility rate by country of origin

Group	TFR
Total:	4.68
Native:	4.42
Born in other countries:	5.83
Central Americans born outside the country:	6.29
Other born outside the country:	2.19

Source: Statistics of Belize, in Arias Foundation (2000), p. 7

These rather rapid and drastic changes and their impact on the demographic profile of the population have been posing a set of serious challenges to the country:

(a)   The influx of migrants into rural areas has caused an increase of solid and liquid wastes which have negatively impacted on the environment;

(b)   Competition over access to basic infrastructure, such as water, education, health and sanitation;

(c)   Increase of unsustainable agricultural practices by immigrants;

(d)   Rising poverty level as a consequence of environmental degradation;

(e)   Particularly in rural areas, migrants working in agriculture add pressure to the natives by accepting work under less favorable conditions and are consequently seen as unequal competitors to be blamed for overall declining salary and benefit schemes;

(f)   Anti-immigrant sentiment expressed by parts of the native population.

In recent years the government has undertaken considerable efforts to address these issues. Legislation was put in place to allow for permanent residency or citizenship if the migrant meets certain requirements. A Refugee Department was established to process the large number of refugees and the Labor Department increased the number of employment permits granted. In 1999 an Amnesty came into effect allowing undocumented migrants and recent arrivals to apply for permanent residency given that a set of conditions was fulfilled by the applicant.

While the government is undertaking efforts to respond to the challenges that past immigration flows have posed on the country over the last 20 years, new migration trends are emerging. On the one hand, more and generally higher qualified people from Asia and North America are now showing an interest in settling in urban areas in the country while, on the other hand, highly qualified natives seek greener pastures in the United States and Canada. Of importance, is the fact that also in Belize more and more qualified women, particularly in teaching and nursing, are successfully gaining employment abroad.

5.3.3 The brain drain in the health sector: Emigration of nurses from Trinidad and Tobago – A case study[19]

The analysis of the nursing situation in Trinidad and Tobago has shown that the present nursing crisis is the result of a variety of push and pull factors. However, with very limited information available the study identified a number of critical aspects that have contributed to the present crisis.

A general weakness in the Caribbean is the lack of timely and reliable data. Particularly difficult is the task of gathering information on migrating nurses from various sources in the source and destination country. Data collection systems are weak and the available data do not allow for further in-depth analysis. No systematic system to monitor the in- and outflow of migrants has been established and only scattered information is available on the emigration of nurses. No data are available on return migration, which would be essential to systematically trace return and recurrent migrant flows. Also no coherent data have been collected to analyze the outflow of nurses over the past 20 years.

Data from the early 1970s already point at the main weaknesses in the public health system which built the main push factors for people to leave. These were:

(a)   Inadequate remuneration and benefits;

(b)   Unfavorable working conditions;

(c)   Lack of management and leadership;

(d)   Insufficient training and professional development;

(e)   Insufficient career-perspectives;

(f)   Under-utilization of acquired skills;

(g)   Burn-out due to increased workload as a consequence of resignations;

(h)   Lack of recognition of profession

Over the years some efforts were undertaken to improve the situation and the information available suggests that the implementation of selected policies along with the worldwide economic recession in the 1980s seems to have slowed down global international recruitment for a short period of time. The growing shortage of nurses in the developed countries and the emerging gaps in the public health sector can be seen as the main driving force for renewed efforts by the developed countries to enhance international recruitment of nurses. International initiatives to control recruitment and to stop poaching from already drained countries seem to have had only a temporary impact, since international recruitment has resumed from all countries and fast track immigration procedures have been put in place in the United States and the United Kingdom.

---

[19] This is a summary of the findings of a study on nurse migration published by this office in 2003 (ECLAC, 2003b).

Similarly, with the growing nurse shortage in the United States, Canada and the United Kingdom, attractive job offers are made by those in need and consequently the pull factors identified earlier have become stronger over the past decades:

(a)   Attractive payments and benefits;

(b)   Modern human resources management;

(c)   Professional work-environment;

(d)   Possibility of permanent residency in the receiving country (Green-card in the United States);

(e)   Financial support for registration and immigration procedures provided by foreign employers;

(f)   Supportive network of family and friends;

(g)   Opportunities for professional development and career advancement;

(h)   Professional Recognition;

(i)   Improved quality of life for self and family.

To ease the pressure on the public health system in Trinidad, the government has begun to recruit nurses from Cuba and the Philippines. While this is not a viable long-term solution, it provides immediate relieve for those in need of health services.

Outlook

The need to address this eminent shortage of nurses comprehensively and to come up with a viable solution respecting the interests of various stakeholders at the national, regional and international level has risen to a global challenge. The international recruitment and placement of nurses and other health professionals is a fairly economic process, which inflicts costs on the sending as well as the receiving countries. Presumably only such approaches which integrate the various interests of all stakeholders will create a win-win situation for all parties concerned and will be sustainable in the long term. The credibility, strength and universality of possible solutions will directly depend on the political will of health sector stakeholders at all levels.

Whatever approach will be chosen, the need to address the present nursing crisis is critical since with the ageing of the population and the emerging HIV/AIDS crisis the demand for nursing care will grow considerably in the near future.

6. SUMMARY AND OUTLOOK

In a world of 100 million migrants, migration is a major social phenomenon, as it has been for thousands of years and the Caribbean is by no means an exception. While the absolute numbers of migrants in this region might be small, the impact of the in- and outflow of people in these countries is by no means negligible.

The present study has shown that in the case of the Caribbean, migration has many faces, forms and expressions. People migrate seasonally over a certain period of time within the region, while others leave their home country on a long-term basis to find work abroad. People move documented and undocumented; sometimes those who start off as regular migrants remain in the receiving country after their visa has expired and thus become irregular. While historically more men migrated among the islands, female migration is growing steadily, with many new windows of opportunities opening for young and highly qualified women who seek employment in the health and education sectors in North America and the United Kingdom. The less qualified hope to find work in the less favourable sectors of the economy, such as agriculture and construction. In the case of women and girls, this also includes prostitution in tourist destinations in the Caribbean and abroad.

Not all Caribbean countries are affected in the same way by migration. While some, particularly the smaller Eastern Caribbean islands, have been mainly source countries for migrants, other economically more prosperous countries have attracted streams of laborers from the region but also increasingly from South and Central America. A third group of countries experiences considerable inflows while at the same time their own nationals seek greener pastures abroad.

Research worldwide has shown that such movements are strongly related to the socio-economic development in the source, as well as in the destination, countries. The availability of jobs, reasonable pay and acceptable working conditions along with personal security make some countries a rather attractive destination for many; while social and political unrest along with economic instability and high unemployment rates build the basis to push people across their national borders to seek economic prosperity elsewhere.

Some countries, particularly those with high unemployment, do favor the departure of their surplus labor, quite often in order to benefit from remittances, which in many cases provide the desperately needed resources to poorer families to make ends meet. However, this analysis has also shown that remittances are by no means sufficient to compensate for the losses incurred as a consequence of the brain drain that is affecting particularly in the health and education sectors in the region.

Other issues in relation to migration in the Caribbean are the growing number of trafficked persons and deportations. With regard to return migration, new windows of opportunities are opening with retirees coming back from the Diaspora. To benefit from their prosperity and quite often willingness to invest in the region, more should be done to facilitate such endeavors.

While the brain drain is a matter of serious concern for almost all countries in the Caribbean, the region, in collaboration and in support of regional and global institutions, as a joint effort by the Regional Nursing Body (RNB), CARICOM, PAHO and the Commonwealth

Secretariat, have begun to seek solutions to maximize the benefits and minimize the losses encumbered. Laudable initiatives have been launched in the area of nursing to promote nursing, to retain qualified professionals and to encourage the return of those already living abroad.

More needs to be done to improve the monitoring of migration flows since very little data are available on the in- and outflow of people from and to Caribbean countries. Also the in- and outflow of resources (in cash and kind) from and to the region needs more attention. While in some countries the balance of payments can give a reasonable indication of the level of remittances received in the case of resource flows in both directions, a balance does not provide much insight. While most of the research on remittances focuses on the receiving end, more detailed information is needed to better understand those who remit.

The discussion of migration in the Caribbean has clearly shown that migration in this region does not happen in isolation. Caribbean islands and countries are geopolitically sandwiched between the North American continent and Latin America, a fact that along with historic cross-border family ties and, in many cases, a common language encourages mobility within the American continent. Economic development determined by global and regional trade agreements are setting the socio-economic, but also legal, framework for migratory movements within and also outside the American hemisphere.

Migration over the past thousand years has changed and will continue to change the world. Globalization, modern means of communication and fast travel will encourage even more people to make a move. Further, gaps between the rich and the poor will promote migratory streams across borders, quite often against the expressed will of the receiving countries. In order to protect all migrants and to safeguard basic human rights of those affected by migration, sustainable partnerships among all stakeholders are indispensable to find viable solutions to the challenges migratory societies are faced within the twenty-first century. The credibility of these partnerships, their strength and universality will directly depend on the political will of all those involved.

Annex I

The following two paragraphs have been copied from the following document:
United Nations General Assembly, International migration and development, Report of the Secretary-General, Fifty-ninth session, A/59/325, 2 September 2004; section IV: Action-oriented options of the United Nations for addressing the issue of international migration and development, para 52 and 53.

The United Nations has played a critical role in establishing legal norms and standards in relation to international migration. The International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families, adopted in 1990, entered in force on 1 July 2003 and has been ratified by 26 States. It is a key instrument with respect to the setting of standards for the treatment, and protection of the welfare and rights, of migrant workers, in conjunction with two ILO conventions, namely, the Migration for Employment Convention (Revised), 1949 (No. 97), and the Migrant Workers (Supplementary Provisions) Convention, 1975 (No. 143), ratified, respectively, by 42 and 18 States. In addition to monitoring the application of the 1990 Convention among States parties, the United Nations will continue to promote its ratification and raise awareness about the importance, in regard to fostering the benefits of international migration, of safeguarding the rights of migrants.

The United Nations has made major strides in advancing a legal framework to prevent and combat the trafficking and smuggling of persons. The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, and the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, both adopted in November 2000, have been signed by more than 100 States.

Annex 2

OUTCOMES DOCUMENT

**Draft Framework of Action for a Programme of
Temporary Movement of Nurses
Agreed at the Caribbean Conference Temporary Movement:
Towards a Trade and Development Approach**

30-31 March 2005, Sherbourne Conference Centre, Barbados

Stakeholders concerned with health, trade and development issues pertaining to nursing services met in Barbados from 30-31 March 2005, and following the various presentations, reviewed the Commonwealth Secretariat and CARICOM/PAHO studies on temporary movement of nurses.

Stakeholders recognized the force of the arguments made as follows:

- The Caribbean is losing approximately 400 nurses per annum through out-migration to Canada, the United Kingdom and the United States.

- The cost of training these nurses is estimated to be US$ 15 to 20 million per annum and loss of trained nurses is a significant transfer of resource from Caribbean countries. Remittances only partly go into national budget while the cost of training is in some cases fully financed from government sources.

- The demand for nurses is expected to rise rapidly in developed countries in the next 15 years as the 'baby boom' generation in OECD countries ages and requires greater levels of medical care.

- In addition to the fiscal loss Caribbean countries also suffer by not having adequate nursing personnel to ensure the delivery of quality health care.

- Continued emigration in the current form will further undermine the sustainability of Caribbean health care systems and the relatively advanced health indicators in the region.

- A failure to address the underlying causes of emigration will mean that the number of nurses leaving the Caribbean to seek economic and professional opportunities elsewhere, will only accelerate in the coming years.

- A vital component of addressing the net losses incurred by Caribbean countries is to channel migration into temporary movement arrangements that maximize the connection between those seeking overseas employment and their home country.

- Notwithstanding the move to the Caribbean Single Market and Economy any option must take into account the specific needs of countries.

Stakeholders reaffirmed that managed migration is defined as a regional strategy for retaining adequate numbers of competent nursing personnel to deliver health programmes and services to Caribbean nationals. It also involves respect for the individual's right to choose where they wish

to work and live. Stakeholders further accepted that there are six critical areas of managed migration, namely: recruitment and retention; terms and conditions of work; education and training; utilization and deployment; value and recognition; and, management practice and policy development.

Stakeholders agreed that a balance needs to be struck between the temporary movement of nurses and ensuring that the capacity and quality of the health care system and related services delivered in Caribbean source countries is not unduly compromised.

Stakeholders endorsed the proposal to establish a system for the temporary movement of nurses from the Caribbean as part of a trade and development approach to managing the high social and economic cost of emigration of health care professionals.

Stakeholders also endorsed the wider approaches for managed migration consistent with the recommendations of the Caribbean Commission for Health and Development that take into account the range of initiatives that are being undertaken by the governments, the Regional Nursing Body, professional nurses organizations and in the private sector.

Stakeholders further endorsed the recommendation that regardless of the option being pursued the region must establish partnerships and develop its strategy for resource to expand the capacity of current and future training programmes.

Stakeholders recommended the establishment of a steering committee, chaired by a Minister of Health and comprising CARICOM, Health, education and training bodies (including RNB), Trade Labour and Immigration officials, the CNO and the CARICAD, coordinated by CARICOM for the development of implementation of a coherent structure for managing the temporary movement of nurses. The steering committee shall also meet the stakeholders in the destination countries to initiate a fact finding mission in the Caribbean and brainstorm on the opportunity within the framework of a managed migration process.

Stakeholders also agreed that CARICOM in collaboration with Commonwealth Secretariat and other relevant stakeholders should follow up on the initiatives resulting from the Commonwealth Secretariat and CARICOM/PAHO studies.

Stakeholders recommended that CARICOM works with the Canadian Government and other governments, to undertake a pilot project that would provide technical and other forms of cooperation to Caribbean Nursing Schools and Caribbean public nursing system, to expand and upgrade capacity to supply nurses for the local and Canadian markets and work towards accrediting the regional nursing examinations. This pilot project should also examine the feasibility of providing market access for Caribbean nurses on a temporary basis.

Stakeholders also called on multilateral and international institutions including the World Bank, PAHO/WHO, IOM among others to support this initiative.

Stakeholders recommended that there be a review mechanism to evaluate follow-up action and to assess the sustainability of the effort.

Stakeholders thanked the Commonwealth Secretariat for the offer of continued assistance to advance the recommendations from the meeting and invited stakeholders including governments, universities and RNB, among others to support the initiative.

8. REFERENCES

Arias Foundation (2000), Migration and Integration in Belize: Realities and Responses, San Jose, Costa Rica

ECLAC/CDCC, UNFPA (2003a). Report of the Caribbean subregional meeting to assess the implementation of the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development 10 years after its adoption. Trinidad and Tobago; LC/CAR/G.761.

ECLAC/CDCC (2003b). Emigration of Nurses from the Caribbean: Causes and consequences for the socio-economic welfare of the country: Trinidad and Tobago – a case study. Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago, LC/CAR/G.748

Mills Frank (2002). CSA Presidential Address 29th Annual Conference of the Caribbean Studies Association, St. Kitts and Nevis, May 31 to June 4, 200

ECLAC/CDCC (1998). The impact of Immigration on Caribbean Microstates: Bahamas, British Virgin Islands, St. Maarten, United States Virgin Islands, LC/CAR/G.540

National Human Development Committee (2002). Belize: 2002 Poverty Assessment Report, Belmopan, Belize

Oakers, Betsy (1992). Workers in the British Virgin Islands: The Complexities of Residence and Migration in: Social and Economic Studies 41:1 (March 1992), pp 67-87

Population Division of the United Nations Secretariat. International Migration, Wallchart, 2002, ST/ESA/SER.A/219, Sales No.E3.XIII.3

Report of the World Summit for social Development. (Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995), A/Conf.166/9, 19 April 1995, Annex 1

Thomas-Hope, Elisabeth (2002). Human Trafficking in the Caribbean and the Human Rights of Migrants, paper presented at the Hemispheric Conference on Migration: Human Rights and the Trafficking of Persons in the Americas, ECLAC/CELADE, Santiago, Chile

United Nations (2003). Population Division of the United Nations Secretariat, World Population Prospects, The 2002 Revision, Vol. I: Comprehensive Tables, ST/ESA/SER.A/222, Sales No. E.03.XIII.6

United Nations (2002). Population Division of the United Nations Secretariat, International Migration, Wallchart, 2002, ST/ESA/SER.A/219, Sales No. EO3.XIII.3

United Nations, (1995). Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, Fourth World Conference on Women, 15 September 1995, A/CONF.177/20 (1995)

United Nations (1994). Population and Development. Programme of Action adopted at the International Conference on Population and Development, Cairo, 5-13 December 1994, Sales No. E.95.XIII.7

World Health Organisation (WHO) (2002). Imbalances in the Health Workforce, Briefing Paper by Pascal Zurn, Mario Dal Poz, Barbara Stillwell and Orvil Adams