

INT-2291

UNITED NATIONS RESEARCH INSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT  
PROGRAMME IV - REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT

TRAINING IN COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING  
(Material for discussion)

Geneva  
January 1969  
UNRISD/69/C.3  
GE.69-2524



<u>COMMENTS BY:</u>	<u>Page</u>
John Friedmann	1 - 3
Ján Feriáno	4 - 5
A. Ghosh	6 - 7
Victor Grosman	8 - 18
Behdan Gruchman	19 - 20
J.G.M. Hilhorst	21 - 24
Kálmán Kádas	25 - 26
L.H. Klaassen	27 - 28
Antoni R. Kuklinski	29 - 33
Aleksander Matejko	34 - 35
Z.J. Piore	36 - 40
Lloyd Rodwin	41
John Owen M. Rowlands	42 - 45
P. Sen Gupta	46 - 50
Torcuato S. Di Tella	51 - 52

1. The first part of the document discusses the importance of maintaining accurate records of all transactions. It emphasizes that this is crucial for ensuring the integrity of the financial statements and for providing a clear audit trail.

2. The second part of the document outlines the various methods used to collect and analyze data. It includes a detailed description of the sampling process and the statistical techniques employed to interpret the results.

3. The third part of the document presents the findings of the study. It shows that there is a significant correlation between the variables being studied, which supports the hypothesis that was tested.

4. The fourth part of the document discusses the implications of the findings. It suggests that the results have important implications for the field of research and for the development of future studies.

5. The fifth part of the document concludes the study and provides a summary of the key points. It also includes a list of references and a list of figures and tables.

(ii)

Covering Note

Introduction

Within the framework of its regional development programme, UNRISD should aim at solving problems concerning the training of regional planners for and in the developing countries. As a first step in this direction, I am presenting in this document the comments received from scholars, planners and experts representing different empirical, theoretical and methodological backgrounds, different political and social systems, and different countries and continents. 1/

From the diversity of opinions expressed on the subject, 2/ one conclusion is quite clear - there is an urgent need to promote the training of regional planners according to the realities and needs of the developing countries. It is hoped that in the immediate future, both international organizations and national governments will make every effort to solve the difficult problems involved in this field.

  
Antoni R. Kuklinski

- 1/ The comments represent the personal views of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the institutions with which they are associated.
- 2/ More comments on the material would be appreciated so that at a future date the subject can be further discussed in an additional document.

Geneva

January 1969<sup>3</sup>

1948

1948

The following table shows the results of the survey conducted in 1948. The data is presented in two columns, with the first column representing the number of respondents and the second column representing the percentage of respondents. The survey was conducted among a group of individuals, and the results are as follows:

Category	Number of Respondents	Percentage of Respondents
Category 1	15	15%
Category 2	25	25%
Category 3	35	35%
Category 4	45	45%
Category 5	55	55%
Category 6	65	65%
Category 7	75	75%
Category 8	85	85%
Category 9	95	95%
Category 10	105	105%

1948

The following table shows the results of the survey conducted in 1948. The data is presented in two columns, with the first column representing the number of respondents and the second column representing the percentage of respondents. The survey was conducted among a group of individuals, and the results are as follows:

Category	Number of Respondents	Percentage of Respondents
Category 1	15	15%
Category 2	25	25%
Category 3	35	35%
Category 4	45	45%
Category 5	55	55%
Category 6	65	65%
Category 7	75	75%
Category 8	85	85%
Category 9	95	95%
Category 10	105	105%

1948

NOTES ON WORLDWIDE REGIONAL PLANNING TRAINING PROGRAMS

by

Professor John Friedmann  
Ford Foundation, Santiago, Chile.

10 May 1963

In connection with Ernest Weissmann's efforts to establish a world-wide training programme in regional development planning, it occurs to me that we should distinguish among four levels of education and training.

The highest level would include doctoral programs in regional economics and regional science. At the present time, such studies can be pursued only in the U.S. at such centers as the University of Pennsylvania, Pittsburgh University or Washington University at Saint Louis.

The second level refers to programs leading to a Master's Degree or its equivalent. These programs last generally from one to two years. There are at the present time a number of international centers where course work may be pursued, such as CIDU and CENDES in Latin America. In Europe there is a regional planning course which will be offered for the first time this year at the Netherlands Institute for Social Studies at The Hague. There are similar courses in Poland, Ireland, and I believe, France. Israel is offering a program in rural aspects of regional development at the Settlement Study Center, at Rehovot. I believe that Japan is also in the process of creating a regional planning study center for Asia.

The third level would include certificate courses having an intermediate duration of 3 to 4 months. This level is not as yet very well defined, and, consequently, lacks an institutional structure. It is clear that during the short period of a few months one cannot turn out fully prepared specialists in regional

planning. It would seem that the best proposal at this level would be to provide in-service training to technical personnel currently working on programs of regional development. Within Latin America, such courses have not as yet been offered, but ILPES is apparently moving in this direction. The best way to organize such courses would be on a multi-national basis defined so that regional problems in the participating countries would be roughly similar. Thus we could think of programs for (1) "el Cono Sur", (2) Brazil, (3) a group of Andean countries, (4) the Caribbean, and (5) Mexico and Central America. The nature of such courses suggests further that they should be organized around particular case studies (workshop format) leading to a maximum of student participation.

The lowest level of training comprises certificate courses of very short duration (3 to 6 weeks). These, too, would have in-service training character but would be offered on a purely national basis. The subjects of these courses would vary according to demand, but in no event would an effort be made to compress all subject matter related to regional development into so short a period. Rather these courses would be highly specialized and technical, including such subjects as regional accounting, project evaluation, techniques for spatial analysis, etc.

On a world basis, we are thus confronted by a potential system of training programs and institutions which are distinguished from each other according to the level of training effort, the length of a program, the extent to which the programs are international, multi-national, or national, and the numbers of students participating at each level. Thus, for every Ph.D. in regional science produced at the University of Pennsylvania, a hundred or more students may pass through fourth level courses, dozens of students through intermediate level courses, and perhaps ten students through one or the other of the second level



courses.

The importance of making these distinctions becomes clear when we try to decide how many second-level centers to establish, and where, and how to formulate the proposed course work at the third level. It may also be important to be aware of these distinctions in deciding fellowship programs.

Professor Ján Ferianc  
Research Institute of Regional Economic Planning  
Bratislava, Czechoslovakia

20 November 1968

Dear Professor Kuklinski,

We have received your letter concerning the training of regional planners and comprehensive regional development in developing countries. We take it for a part of materials received from the United Nations before. We have studied the material and discussed it with respective institutions in Czechoslovakia interested in the programme. On the basis of it we should like to interpret our general approach to these problems.

We are of the same opinion as you that regional planning in developing countries is a great and long-term problem which can be solved besides other ways especially by the training of the desirable number of qualified planners. As far as the total need of regional planners, there are required different numbers but, nevertheless, it is obvious that the question is to educate some hundreds of experts in a relatively short time.

Taking into consideration the proposed need of experts, we agree with your suggestions of the training programme. From our point of view there should be the possibility for us to take an active part in the training programme by arranging seminars and post graduate courses. For your information, we announce that the training centre in Czechoslovakia can be established at the School of Economics in Bratislava. This School prepares a post graduate course for regional planners in Czechoslovakia, taking one semester in cooperation with our Institute as well as with other institutes in Czechoslovakia. This course is supposed to be started in the second semester of the school year 1968/69. We believe that the teachers organized for the mentioned course may become the basic body of experts for the training centre in our Republic.

We note that there are post graduate courses of two years for territorial planners and architects realized at the Technical College in Brno since years. These courses are determined especially for planners working at departments of construction of district committees as well as for workers of various institutions dealing with the problems of urbanization.

In your material you emphasize the fact that the training programme ought to be accommodated to the conditions in developing countries. With the exception of some tens of experts who had been working in the service of the U.N.O. in various developing countries, the majority of regional planners in Czechoslovakia have not had till now many possibilities for obtaining the necessary experience and knowledge about the concrete conditions of development in respective developing countries. For this reason we take the liberty of proposing to you that at least a limited number of regional planners could take part in some activities organized by the U.N.O. in developing countries in order to be acquainted with the concrete problems of these countries. The adequate number of qualified experts with experience in the national, regional, interregional and territorial economic planning in Czechoslovakia are available already now.

We would like to inform you on this occasion that the preparatory work on the establishment and organization of a data bank and information in Czechoslovakia is reaching the final stage. The Terplan Prague, which has already received many detailed data about territorial, technical and demographical conditions and resources in individual regions, microregions and settlements as well as in the whole Czechoslovak republic was entrusted with the establishment of the data bank.

Professor A. Ghosh  
Jadavpur University, Calcutta

31 October 1968

Dear Dr. Kuklinski,

Many thanks for your letter of 11 October 1968.

I have read through your programmes carefully, and generally agree with the points made in your reports. My main concern however, is this. In many cases such international training programmes become too abstract and generalized to be of use for developmental work and it degenerates into abstract course in economics. To avoid this, it is necessary while setting up the training course to take into your consultation such Economists and Institutes who can give you some ideas regarding the various difficulties in their region in planning activities. It is also necessary that the course should be operated in such institution in the developing countries where continuous work on this problem is being carried out. I shall, therefore, outline some of the comments on your programmes as follows:

In section 2 apart from 1, 2 and 3, you should also include some of the problems of plan harmonization between several developing countries and the problems of planning by federal centres where both federal centres and provincial centres have independent developmental plans.

In section 3, I agree with the training activities you have proposed. In this connection I should like to suggest that in view of the experience acquired in this line the Applied Economics Section, Jadavpur University, Calcutta, may be

considered for such a centre. As you are aware in this University over the last 7 years sustained research has been carried out on problems of regional and inter-regional development and a number of research studies have been completed here on these aspects. A study has also been just completed on the location of industrial complex in a region under a fairly long time horizon. This research material will soon be made available to you. Some of the results were presented in a report in last Input-output conference in Geneva, 1968. At the present moment work is being done through this centre for output and employment projection by sector for a number of countries, e.g. Ceylon, Malaysia, Taiwan, Korea and Philippines. This work has been entrusted to the centre by ECAFE (U.N.) and is a recognition of the expertise available in this University for this type of work. Calcutta being close to the East Asian group of countries such a centre in this University will be most useful.

In any case immediate implementation may be made for Ph.D in Regional development and planning from this centre and if suitable support is given it will be easy to design and implement Ph.D studies in regional development and planning for some selected countries of the ECAFE regions from this centre.

I agree with your final remark about this being a long-run and large-scale problem. But my suggestion is that for effective training the centres should be dispersed as much as possible and each centre should specialize in a number of countries and their problems. Otherwise there is a chance that the course will degenerate into usual type of University-Course given to the graduate students. Such courses give the students the formal acquaintance of the subject rather than a feel of the subject. In other words quality and direct grasp rather than quantity must be an important criterion for such a training course.

Thanking you etc., etc.,

A. Ghosh  
Professor of Applied Economics.

October 1968

TRAINING OF REGIONAL PLANNERS: SOME PRELIMINARY REMARKS

VICTOR GROSMA<sup>1</sup>

C O N T E N T S

1. Nature of the problem: the challenge of regional backwardness.
2. Regional planning and planners: the preconditions.
3. An additional necessary pre-condition.
4. Summing-up: concluding remarks.

<sup>1</sup> The author is presently working at SUDENE (Superintendency for the Development of the Northeast) Brazil, as Economic Advisor of the United Nations Office of Technical Cooperation. The points of view expressed herein represent, however, the personal opinions of the author and do not involve the organizations with whom he is presently engaged.

1. NATURE OF THE PROBLEM: the challenge of regional backwardness

1.1 It is generally accepted today, that it is imperative for all regions of a country to grow permanently and systematically; not only for reasons of social justice, but economic ones as well.

1.2: Regional backwardness means low productivity, production deficits, lack of purchasing power, smallness of the internal market and its derived monopolistic structure, little diversification of production, extreme dependence on the exploration of a very few primary products; lack of infrastructure, incipient capital formation and poor social conditions for the population in general (health, housing and education).

1.3: Backward regions do generate, however, some potential human and capital resource capacities which would tend to migrate to the rich areas when the necessary opportunities and pre-conditions (or the adequate "social climate", to put it in Schumpeter's words), are not found in the area. "Rich get richer and poor get children", "vicious circles of poverty and wealth", Myrdal's "backwash effects" "brain drain" and so on, are sentences and names currently used to reflect the type of situation alluded to.

1.4. But do we need to worry about each and every specific area within each country? Aren't the multiplier and accelerator effects or both combined (leverage effect) reliable enough? That is to say, would it not suffice to undertake large-scale investment projects in well selected sectors and areas at a national level, and let the above mentioned effects operate fully and smoothly?

1.5 Unfortunately, we well know, that the effects of an initial investment get weaker the further away the areas involved are located. (Not to mention the traditional saving and consumption propensities of the marginal analysis, as restrictions to the multiplier process).

Furthermore, what could be regarded as 'priority' or even 'optimum' from a national standpoint, might prove irrelevant or meaningless for many regions of the same territory.

1.6. It is thus imperative that all regions have an active share in the benefits of development, the regions themselves constituting the dynamic elements of the expanding process of the economy. This legitimate and necessary regional participation can be materialized and consolidated only through comprehensive regional planning.<sup>2/</sup> In most backward areas, however, regional planning does not exist, simply because the basic pre-conditions do not exist. Two of these basic pre-conditions are: the "socio-institutional framework" and a well trained team of regional planners, with a broad understanding of the prevailing conditions and possibilities of developing areas.

1.7 Some of the other backward regions, even in the absence of the two basic pre-conditions have "imported" the planning approach and structure, and the corresponding planners from developed countries. The results have not always been the desirable ones, in view of the different problems and priority scales faced by both types of areas.

Even the public sector, undoubtedly one of the outstanding planning agents, has quite a differentiated role in each type of country. While in developed countries this role is accurately defined by the concept of "welfare state", tending to compensate for income differentials, in underdeveloped countries the main role of the Government is precisely to achieve a substantial increase in per capita real income, i.e., a strong economic development policy.

We do recognize, however that some benefits can be derived from the developed countries experience, once such an experience is

---

<sup>2/</sup> Apparently, we have gone a long way before arriving at this starting point; this has been deliberate. In fact the previous presentation will be useful to justify our following approach to this issue.



adequately 'adapted' to a different environment.

2. REGIONAL PLANNING AND PLANNERS - the pre-conditions

2.1 We mentioned above the "socio-institutional framework", as a pre-condition for regional development and planning. With this concept we wish to refer to the great variety of intangible factors which contribute to an adequate "response" to the "challenge" (to put it in Toynbee's terms) of any effort toward regional development.<sup>3/</sup> Such things as discipline, education, cooperation, spirit of sacrifice, sense of responsibility, perseverance, cultural background, spirit of enterprise and innovation, among many others, are included in this category.

2.2 If we really want to make a lasting contribution to the developing countries, we should stimulate the understanding and acceptance of the duties and responsibilities of each member of the community in the collective effort. In this sense, we find that an annual seminar "for about twenty high governmental officials from the developing countries at the ministerial and directorial levels"<sup>4/</sup> could be very helpful in getting the required understanding and support at the upper levels.

2.3 We feel that this one condition is not sufficient however, and that a massive mobilization of public opinion is needed. Seminars, lectures, round-table discussions, with the participation of leaders and representatives of the various sectors should be promoted in developing countries. Financial and technical assistance could be furnished to qualified local institutions (universities, for example), through the signature of intermediate-term (from one to three years) and long run agreements. Adequate publications, should also be distributed. We are convinced that the 'feeling of participation' and the identification of the

---

<sup>3/</sup>Incidentally, here we have another set of elements which clearly differentiate the prevailing conditions in developed and under-developed countries. In other words, this is an additional - and very important reason why the experience of the first group is not directly applicable to the latter countries.

<sup>4/</sup>Proposed by Dr. Antoni R. Kuklinski, in his paper: "Training in Comprehensive Regional Development and Planning", 4 Dec. 1967, p.3 (mimeo).

people with the aims and efforts involved in regional development, are absolutely indispensable. We do not want the plans and programs prepared by the technicians to be condemned to share the 'destiny' of many documents of this type, this is, that they just increase the files of planning agencies.

2.4. There is no doubt that a long-run and large scale effort is required. It is clear that results will be obtained only after several years. We know, on the other hand, that in underdeveloped countries in general, investment projects with short maturity periods are preferred, in spite of their having lower rates of return. In our case, however, it is worthwhile starting the 'big push' even though it will take some time before collecting the fruits of our actions.

2.5 Now we come to the second pre-condition - and one of the most serious bottlenecks in fostering regional development in backward areas, that is, the availability of a suitable team of regional planners, both in quantity and quality. Instead of entering into the analysis of detailed courses and training programs leading to the formation of regional planners,<sup>5/</sup> we prefer to offer our preliminary remarks on the type of professional that is required.

What is needed is a person capable of determining the desired goals, organizing the actions to be taken, putting them into execution coordinating the various steps and functions, and to permanently look for the best possible way of attaining the goals.

2.6 The formation of this type of professional implies a greater effort than simple technical training. The trainees should be given a thorough understanding of the functions they will have to accomplish and the role the community will assign to them in the common effort towards the improvement of the living status. They

---

<sup>5/</sup> The structure and contents of courses and programs leading to the preparation of this type of professional is an interesting matter and big enough to fully justify the arrangement of a special work-shop as proposed by Dr. Kuklinski in his paper mentioned above, page 4, par.2.

need to be leaders, real influential agents of economic development.

An apparent dichotomy may arise: is it wise to form experts in regional comprehensive planning? Would it not be preferable to train highly specialized technicians in specific fields (e.g., industry, agriculture, transportation, public sector programming)?<sup>6/</sup>

Our opinion is that in both cases a strong socio-economic background should be given in order to get a full understanding of reality. Furthermore, a general program could be established (4 to 6 months) allowing three months for sectorial specialization. The obvious conclusion is that both types of specialists are required; unidisciplinary and multidisciplinary experts should integrate their efforts.

2.7 We are faced with various alternative programs in the solution of the deficit of qualified planners for developing regions. Our point of view is that a 4 to 6 months program would suffice to prepare an adequate general planner in regional development. As pointed out above, a 3 months specialization could also be considered. Under the present circumstances, the urgency of the problem does not make it advisable to spend further time trying to create a more refined or sophisticated professional.

2.8 In the long-run, however, the picture is a little different. We are firmly in favour of the creation of specialized departments in the universities of developing countries to deal with regional training and research.<sup>7/</sup> We believe that universities have a significant leadership role to play in the establishment of an adequate "socio-institutional framework"<sup>8/</sup> and in the formation of the future regional planners as well.<sup>9/</sup>

<sup>6/</sup> Incidentally, we discussed this issue fully at the Meeting of Latin American Institutes and Research Centers for Development held in Caracas, Venezuela, from 12 to 16 October 1966. See "Memoria de la Reunión", CENDES, Caracas, 1966 (mimeo).

<sup>7/</sup> As proposed by Dr. Kuklinski in his paper, op.cit., p.4.

<sup>8/</sup> See paragraph 2.1 above.

<sup>9/</sup> Our position could not be otherwise, since we have devoted ten years to full-time university activities in Chile.

2.9 We would like to emphasize the concentration of teaching and research in these departments: A teaching institution without research, runs the risk of becoming too academic and removed from reality. Likewise, a research organization without teaching implies that the installed capacity will either be underemployed, or that there will be a loss of human and financial resources, neither of which the developing countries can afford. It should be remembered that teaching benefits from practical experience, and knowledge of prevailing conditions derived from research.

2.10 We are consequently in favour of the implementation of a graduate program which would apply the 'highest level of professional and academic standards'. If the graduates from developing countries be required to spend, let us say, four years in centers of developed countries we then incur serious risks, which have to be accounted for. The most important one is the problem of alienation. Even though the program be specially designed for developing countries, the trainee lives, studies in a developed environment, and therefore works with a quite different set of problems and possibilities. Unfortunately, the cases of frustration and inadaptability upon returning to their native countries, are not infrequent in Latin America.

The solution we think should combine reasonable periods of training and work in both developed and developing countries.

### 3. AN ADDITIONAL NECESSARY PRE-CONDITION

3.1 We can deduce up to this point the enormous responsibility which is implied by the creation of the pre-conditions for successful regional planning. Suitable courses seminars, round-table discussions and training programs must be organized for the developing countries. Adequate fellowships, technical and financial assistance should be granted, if we want to make a real contribution. But this is only a part of the story.

3.2 In fact, the formation of regional planners, together with the necessary socio-institutional framework, are not enough. There is still an additional aspect which cannot be neglected.

It is indispensable, at the regional level, to create sufficiently attractive stimuli for the trained people to return and stay in their regions, and to interest highly qualified experts to transfer to the less developed areas, at least during the early stages of development.<sup>10/</sup> We will thus be contributing to the attenuation of the excessive concentration and centralization oftenly observed at present, thereby slowing down the permanent exodus of qualified personnel from the regions where they are more urgently needed. The real causes of the onerous brain drain should be faced.

3.3 One of the best incentives to achieve a fixation of personnel in their corresponding areas - once trained - is undoubtedly related to the possibility of such personnel finding well remunerated employment opportunities in those areas. This fact has two basic implications:

i) One must make sure that the formed regional planners really satisfy the needs of developing countries.<sup>11/</sup>

ii) An adequate wage policy should be fostered as an incentive to qualified technicians to remain in the less developed areas since they generally tend to migrate to the big metropolitan centers, both national and foreign looking for better employment

---

<sup>10/</sup>We are referring mainly to local experts living in the big metropolitan centers of the same country. Of course, experts from abroad could also help the developing regions in trying to find their own solutions for the peculiar problems faced by them in the early stages of development.

<sup>11/</sup>That is why we have argued above that the discussion of detailed training programs should and deserve to be treated separately in an exhaustive way, exceeding the scope of the preliminary remarks contained in this paper.

opportunities and wider horizons.<sup>12/</sup>

3.4 It should not be thought, however, that salary incentives will suffice. The creation of what could be called a socio-cultural infrastructure in less developed areas is needed: favourable working conditions; a stimulating cultural environment; the possibility of a permanent dialogue able to satisfy the academic and intellectual anxieties, i.e. the suitable conditions for the full development of the individual.

There is no doubt about the outstanding role of the universities in this important field of human development.

4. SUMMING-UP; concluding remarks

4.1 We pointed out some relevant aspects that characterize the problem of training regional planners for developing countries. The detailed discussion of the solutions would exceed, by far, the scope of these preliminary remarks.

4.2 The regional planner is conceived as something more than simply a qualified technician. He must be given a strong socio-economic background so as to provide him with a thorough understanding of the reality in his work area and the leadership role he will have to play. As both general and sectorial regional planners are required, their work must be integrated.

4.3. Several alternative programs exist to create such a type of professional whose duration and structure of training may vary from four months to four years. This vast and important

---

<sup>12/</sup> We admit, of course, that such matters as salary policies are internal problems of each country or region and, consequently, cannot be determined or significantly influenced by international organizations like the United Nations, for example. We do think, nevertheless, that this issue could and should be considered in the proposed seminars for high governmental officials from developing countries (See item 2.2).

question deserves a specific separate discussion that was not explicated here. Two general recommendations were made however; a) that short term programs should be implemented, in view of the urgency of the problem; b) that adequate periods of time, spent by the trainees, both in developed and developing countries, should be combined in programs of several years duration which will provide a solution in the long run. This would be required for the formation of professionals, with high academic standards capable of leading specialized departments in the universities. The possibility of alienation of the trainee must be avoided.

4.4 Undiscriminated importation of experts, theories, and approaches from developed countries, cannot be considered a good solution for the developing areas. It should be remembered that the physical, social and cultural environments are different, as is the role played by the government in each type of society. This does not imply that the developed countries should be systematically and completely neglected. Valid lessons from the experience of the developed countries can be obtained, but they must be considered as complementary to the efforts which the developing countries are making to find a way out to their particular situations.

4.5 Suitable conditions should be established so that the planner's work can be fruitful: identifying the community with the common effort towards regional development. Lectures, seminars and round-table discussions should be promoted not only for top level governmental officials, but also for selected leaders of all representative sectors of developing regions. Again, the important role of university as previously pointed out, is in the creation of what was called the "socio-institutional framework".

4.6 The planners themselves must be given incentive to stay in their underdeveloped regions after training. An important element to be considered is wage policy. Good working conditions and a stimulating cultural environment should be provided so as to stop the present brain drain.

4.7 The task to be undertaken and the responsibilities involved are enormous. We think that institutions such as the United Nations are in an excellent position to take the initiative. Considering the fact that more than three fourths of the world's population lives in backward areas and deserves better, more human subsistence conditions, therefore any effort applied is definitely worthwhile.



Dr. Behdan Gruchman, Regional Development Planner  
United Nations Development Programme, Tripoli, Libya

7 November 1962

1. Assessment of Demand for Regional Planners in Developing Countries

There is a number of reasons why we should attach more importance to regional planning in developing countries than we do in advanced economies. The developing countries usually have a strongly differentiated spatial structure with marked disproportions in the level of development between the competent parts of the system. If nothing else, there is almost always the contrast between the central city and the rest of the country. In developing countries, the planning of infrastructural facilities which are prerequisites for a take-off and sustained growth also calls for a regional approach owing to the very nature of such basic facilities. Development planning in these countries puts a strong emphasis on individual projects and consequently exposes the locational aspects at an early stage of the planning process. Last but not least, there are numerous political factors which explain the growing attractiveness of regional planning to the developing countries.

Therefore, the demand for regional planners in such countries is going to be a sizeable one. It will be oriented toward two categories of people:

- (a) To "full-time" regional planners working both on the national and the regional levels;
- (b) To "part-time" regional planners working in sectors with particularly strong regional aspects of development (for instance, agriculture, transportation, housing).

We have to be oriented toward both groups of planners because each of them will contribute to the overall spatial growth of the economies in developing countries. In particular, the second group should not be left out of our focus as regional planning evolves from formulating long-term plans for individual regions to action programmes on a national level embracing all parts of the country.

In a country like Libya with its relatively small population and yet with a vast territory, a preliminary estimate of a ten years' demand for the first category of planners sums up to about 120 persons. The need for the second

category would add another 120 to 150 persons to the overall demand. It follows that the general world deficit for regional planners in the Second Development Decade is likely to be closer to 5,000 persons (if not an even higher figure) than to the conservative estimate of 2,000 persons.

## 2. Types of Training Activities

All three types of training activities proposed in your paper are extremely important for a successful launching of the world-wide regional training programme. The seminars for high governmental officials in the developing countries will help regional planning to take the proper place in the overall system of planning. They will also help to remove the existing confusion concerning the role and functions of regional planning.

The post-graduate courses will carry the main burden of preparing regional planners for the next decade. Therefore, their curriculum must be meticulously worked out with emphasis on teaching programmes, commensurate to conditions actually existing in developing countries. A substantial body of regional theory and of the European and North American experience in regional planning must be thoroughly revised before it can be applied to a developing economy. A workshop concerned with these matters is certainly very necessary.

Besides post-graduate courses for regional planners, it will be necessary to develop some form of training for the above-mentioned "part-time" regional planners. Courses for them could be much shorter (two to three months), possibly arranged on a sectoral basis. For example, a separate course in regional planning could be run for agricultural planners, another one for social planners, etc. Such courses should demonstrate in concrete case studies the necessity and value of a regional approach in the relevant sectors.

Ph.D. studies are self-explanatory. They will be destined for a small number of graduates who show a particular interest in the regional field of study and are well equipped to carry on research.

Besides them judging from my own experience, there is a large group of planners with an under-graduate background who would like to work toward a Master's Degree. Usually, such a possibility does not exist in their home country and they are looking toward universities abroad for an opportunity to complete their formal education. The establishment of a greater number of Master's Degree courses in regional analysis and development would considerably increase the attractiveness of this field of study and result in additional numbers of well trained regional planners.

Dr. J.G.M. Hilhorst  
Institute of Social Studies, The Hague

October 17 1968

Dear Dr. Kulinski,

Thank you very much for your letter of August 28 as well as for your enclosure entitled "Training in Comprehensive Regional Development and Planning".

I agree fully with the overall scope of your paper, although I have a few remarks related to some details.

a. On page 3 you say that the interrelation of regional planning and community development is the most important for the regional planning specialization. It would seem as if you see both as well as physical planning as separate subjects altogether. To my mind community development and physical planning as well as economic planning are part of the overall process of regional planning and can only be given their proper place within the framework of a problem orientated approach.

b. I do have some difficulties with continuing to make a distinction between direct and indicative planning though I know of the existence of each of them as 'ideal types'. I fear that today's revolutionary thinking in socialist and non-socialist countries forces us to see the distinction as an academic one.

c. Whatever your opinion on the two previous points would be I think you would agree that the main purpose of the seminars and post-graduate courses should be to instill participants with a proper conceptual framework and that the teaching staff should

have ample planning experience.

d. As to the seminars I might suggest you call them 'conferences' and I feel that these should be given first priority in time: experience shows that only after high officials have gone through some brain washing they will release lower placed civil servants for attending post-graduate training.

e. I fully agree that the paper about training for regional planning presented by John Friedmann at the Institute of Social Studies' workshop in 1967 would be a good basis for discussion. The programme as he presents it, however, virtually implies that PhD training should take place in the U.S.A., which as far as I can see would not be all that relevant for the situation in the developing countries, unless specializations become part of the programme. I may again and on behalf of the Rector of the Institute of Social Studies inform you that the Institute would gladly assist you in organizing a workshop as you propose on page 4 of your paper. If this workshop would be held during the present academic year an additional advantage for the participants in the workshop would be to see one of the three proposed types of training activities in operation.

#### THE AIMS AND THE CHARACTER OF THE COURSE

The Diploma Course in Regional Development Planning is designed to provide civil servants with an opportunity to gain insight into the problems of regional development in the developing countries, and into the methods and techniques related to regional development planning. It is primarily intended for officials actually engaged in, or about to be engaged in regional planning activities. The focus of the Course will be upon strategies and planning techniques relevant to the developing countries.

The Course falls into five parts:

- I. The spatial organization of human activity.
- II. Planning theory for regional planning.

III. Methods of regional analysis.

IV. Techniques of regional planning.

V. A case study.

The participants will be required to write a research paper. In the case study, a strategy for the development of a region will have to be outlined and tested.

Successful participants will be awarded the diploma in Regional Development Planning.

#### THE STRUCTURE OF THE COURSE

0. Introductory courses in economics, sociology, statistics, elementary mathematics and national accounting.

#### I. THE SPATIAL ORGANIZATION OF HUMAN ACTIVITY

##### 1. National and Regional Structure

1.1. National structure: centre-periphery relations, political-administrative structure.

1.2. Regional structure and change: the development of theory on the region; inter- and intra-regional growth theory.

##### 2. The Distribution of Centres

2.1. Location of the firm.

2.2. Theories of relative location.

##### 3. The Regional Centre

3.1. Geographic expression: urban function and form; theories of urban spatial growth; the city and region.

3.2. The socio-economic significance of the city; history and nature of the city; urban socio-political structure; the city as an innovative centre.

##### 4. The Regional Periphery

4.1. Rural Structure: farming systems and farm types; the spatial ordering of agriculture; the development of modern agriculture.

#### II. PLANNING THEORY FOR REGIONAL PLANNING

##### 5. Planning Theory

5.1. Planning as a Method.

- 5.2. Planning as a Process.
  - 5.2.1. Planning in Stages
  - 5.2.2. Development Administration
  - 5.2.3. Administrative considerations in regional planning
- 5.3. Principles of teamwork

### III. METHODS OF REGIONAL ANALYSIS

- 6. Natural Resource Analysis
- 7. Human Resource Analysis
  - 7.1. Demography: techniques of analysis and projection.
  - 7.2. Manpower analysis: labour force projections and distributions.
- 8. Urban Systems Analysis; urban systems analysis; transport and transit analysis.
- 9. Regional Socio-economic Analysis
  - 9.1. Regional Economic Analysis: regional accounting; inter-regional flows of funds analysis; regional input-output analysis; urban economic base theory.
  - 9.2. Social Service Analysis.
  - 9.3. Regionalization I.

### IV. REGIONAL PLANNING TECHNIQUES

- 10. Regional Development Strategies
  - 10.1. Types of regional and types of strategy.
  - 10.2. Regionalization II.
  - 10.3. Political-administrative implications.
- 11. Plan Formulation
  - 11.1. Methods of target setting and choice of instruments.
  - 11.2. Macro land use and settlement planning.
  - 11.3. Principle of service planning.
  - 11.4. Agricultural planning.
- 12. Instruments of Planning and Plan Implementation
  - 12.1. Project evaluation.
  - 12.2. Programme budgeting.
  - 12.3. Network planning.

### V. CASE STUDY

In addition a number of introductory courses are organized.

Dr. J.G.M. Hilhorst.

Professor Kálmán Kádas  
Budapest Technical University

19 December 1960

I entirely agree with the statement, as a fundamental requirement, namely, that in developing countries proper regional development and the regional planning ensuring it can hardly be realized without properly qualified experts. I also agree with you that a breakthrough can be achieved only if the training of these experts is realized at the very beginning in a considerable number, e.g. 5,000 persons. It is also right to maintain the three kinds of training degrees and to take into consideration primarily those training institutes which are successful from the point of view of training and possess practical experience of this kind, such as the Institute of Social Studies in The Hague and the Central School of Planning and Statistics in Warsaw.

A proper objective (point II) is the specialization for regional and interregional planning fitted into the framework of national planning. It is also proper to reveal the intersectoral and interdisciplinary aspects of these in close relationship, of course, with the corresponding experience of the individual countries.

I think that the training programme, respectively the curriculum of the different training degrees should be elaborated in detail, taking into consideration the most up-to-date methodological results of development and planning, as well as the up-to-date subject matter of fundamental training necessary for their successful application.

In the formulation of these, it is advisable to keep in view that in the scientific and methodological establishment of regional planning, the aim is the establishment of the most favourable development of the processes of social-economic activity also in its territorial division in accordance with the given social-economic preference system. This, of course, requires and results in research and planning branching out in many directions and keeping in view several kinds of management-decision levels, as well as employing various methods. Surely, the processes of social-economic activity are multifold themselves, they are complex in a hardly perspicuous manner, and the spatial territorial construction of these may often assume versions difficult to count. Not to

mention how great are the methodological difficulties and expenditures corresponding to this the handling and transformation of all these involve from the point of view of information. Fortunately, not only the financial sacrifice is great which the implementation of the outlined main objective of regional science demands, but the obtainable result which is then to the advantage of the economy for several years can be also unusually great.

All this logically follows from that scientific realization evolving in its full significance already nowadays that the materialization of the processes social-economic activity in the existing territorial structure is mostly far enough from being optimum according to the endowments, and this structure of territorial division of this activity - mainly for historical reasons - is perhaps even farther from that which could be the most favourable in the given natural, economic and social, etc. environment at present. Consequently, every step which is planned in advance carefully and well considered in these two respects, and especially which is reasonably planned in advance in the second multitude of development tasks requiring a great deal of expenses and time can increase the annual result of social production, respectively the national income by several hundred million dollars. At the same time, this provides an informative evaluation aspect too with regard to the research and the development of regional science and planning and, in certain cases, regarding its very high social-economic efficiency as well. There are especially great possibilities in this field in socialist planned economies where there are very good opportunities for the realization of the overall social-economic interests.



Professor L.H. Klaassen  
Nederlandsch Economisch Instituut, Rotterdam

September 25, 1968

Dear Mr. Kuklinski,

Thank you very much for sending me your note on "Training in Comprehensive regional Development and Planning". I think that this document is a very good starting point for further discussions on the subject.

As regards your question about an international discussion on the training of regional planners for the developing countries, I should like to make the following comments.

In urban planning as well as regional planning the interdisciplinary approach would be a *conditio sine qua non* for a well-balanced training programme. As you know, regional as well as urban planning in the developed world is not based on this interdisciplinary approach. In a number of cases the planning is in the hands of economists, in other cases in those of civil engineers and last but not least of physical planners. In the "normal" case economists or civil engineers lack the insight in both the importance of other disciplines and physical planning, while very often physical planners have a much broader background, unfortunately however often of a rather poor quality. The ideal situation would, as I see it, be that practical regional and urban planning is in the hands of a team of high level experts from all disciplines involved (including social scientists and architects) who have been trained in the techniques of physical planning as a post-graduate course. Only

such a team could be called a physical planning team.

The above means that I do not believe in physical planning as such as long as it is not backed up by a thorough knowledge of the underlying disciplines involved in the process of planning.

The consequences of this is that we should in fact think of two different sorts of courses. One on the level of each discipline involved (graduate courses) and one for introducing the individual discipline in its role in the overall planning process. It therefore seems advisable to link your proposal for giving seminars closely with the set-up of these post-graduated courses, particularly since it will be extremely difficult to find for these courses qualified teachers. They might be found much easier for short seminars than for longer courses.

Your idea of establishing a training center in The Hague as well as in Warsaw seems attractive, although the approach in both centers might prove to be completely different. Freedom of location of industries e.g. is a very crucial point in regional planning and requires a completely different scientific approach than state planning. The study of both approaches, however, seems useful if and in as far as students from developing countries are adequately informed about the consequences of their choice for the programme of their study.

I hope to have given you some useful reflexions on your note and proposal and remain, etc., etc.,

Prof. Dr. L.H. Klaasen.

Antoni R. Kuklinski

TRAINING IN COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING

Problems and Solutions

I. Introduction

The solution of regional problems in the developing countries will be one of the more important issues to be dealt with within the framework of the Second Development Decade (1970-1980). The success of all regional development activities will depend on many factors but it can be agreed that one of the most important will be the supply of qualified personnel.

The Institute of Social Studies in The Hague has presented a tentative evaluation of the size of the deficit of regional planners in the developing countries and has indicated that this deficit has the scale of about 2,000 persons. The first impression suggests that this is an exaggeration, but if we take into account that in a country like Poland, the regional planning offices employ about 300 professional regional planners, then the deficit of 2,000 persons for the developing countries of Latin America, Asia and Africa could be regarded rather as an underestimate. It can be added that the evaluation of the Institute of Social Studies is dealing with the present situation of the late 1960's. If we take into account the prospective of the middle 1970's, when the size and scope of regional planning in the developing countries will be much larger than it is now, then the evaluation of the prospective deficit must be revised upward, perhaps to a number in the range of 5,000. Therefore, if the UN would like to generate a big push in its activity in the field of training of regional planners for the developing countries, this big push must be adapted to the size of the problem. All discussions on how to train a few tens of even a few hundred planners for the developing countries have to be regarded as marginal since such discussions would only result in concealing the real problem rather than trying to solve it. The real problem can be formulated as follows: How to train, under the auspices of the UN programme, a few thousand regional planners as a contribution to the achievement of the goals of the Second Development Decade.

II. Basic Features of the UN Regional Development Training Programmes

The efficiency and purposeful design and implementation of these training programmes can be achieved only if the programmes will adopt the following features:

1. A comprehensive approach to regional development and planning, stressing the validity of inter-sectoral and interdisciplinary problems and solutions.

2. The programmes must be well adapted to the conditions of the developing countries. It would be wrong if the main body of the material incorporated in the training activities would consist of traditional locational theories and methods developed in Europe and the United States. The experiences of the developing countries in solving regional problems should be analysed very thoroughly.

3. The training centres should be specialized in order to have a proper set of choices for the interested specialists from the developing countries. The first choice should be the choice between specialization in interregional planning and specialization in regional planning. The first specialization should be designed for professionals who are involved in interregional planning at the national level within the framework of central planning or programming agencies. In this specialization, the interrelation of national and interregional planning is most important. The second specialization should be in the problems of development of a given region within or outside the framework of a national plan. In this specialization, the interrelation of regional planning and community development activities is the most important. The problems of physical planning and town planning should be discussed also. The second set of choices is the choice between two types of planning or programming institutions and methods that are to be applied in the given developing country. Here, the most important distinction is between direct and indicative planning. These two types of planning are creating quite different conditions for the promotion of regional development.

4. The training activities should be designed and implemented on such a scale that the developing countries would get a few thousand regional planners in the 1970's.

### III. Types of Training Activities

Three types of training activities are proposed:

1. Seminars
2. Post-graduate courses
3. PhD studies
1. Seminars

One of the important conditions for the promotion of regional development activities is the support given to these activities by high governmental officials in the developing countries. It is safe to say that not all governmental

officials who deal with regional problems understand regional development activities. Therefore, I would propose that a seminar be arranged in each year of the Second Development Decade for about twenty high governmental officials from the developing countries at the ministerial and directorial levels. These seminars should last about two weeks and should discuss the strategic problems of regional development and planning in the developing countries.

## 2. Post-graduate courses

As the main channel for training professionals interested in inter-regional and regional development activities, I would propose post-graduate courses of a duration of nine months in regional development and planning. Between ten-fifteen centres should be selected and supported on the assumption that the output of each centre would be about twenty persons yearly. The centres should be located in both developed and developing countries and should be associated with strong already existing training and research institutes. As a starting point for the discussion of the programme of training in such centres, I would propose the experience of a) The Institute of Social Studies in the Hague (which will start a post-graduate diploma course in regional development planning), and b) The Central School of Planning and Statistics in Warsaw (which has developed some experience in the training of Polish regional planners via the activity of a special post-graduate course. Therefore, I would propose that a workshop be arranged in Warsaw or The Hague on regional development training for the developing countries to discuss in detail the programme of teaching in the proposed courses.

## 3. PhD studies

I would propose that two centres be selected to design and implement PhD studies in regional development and planning. These should be four-year courses. In the discussion of the scope of the courses, the ideas of John Friedmann could be useful. The PhD studies should represent the highest level of professional and academic standards. The graduates of the courses should be candidates for the heads of new departments in universities in the developing countries which would develop regional research and training activities. New departments of this kind would solve the problem of training of regional planners in the 1980's.

## IV. Final Remarks

The problem of regional planning in the developing countries is a long-

run and large-scale one. The successful solution of the problem depends, among other things, on the supply of well qualified planners. The United Nations could perform a very important role in generating a breakthrough in the solution of the problem of the deficit of regional planners in the developing countries. The success in this field will be achieved if the solutions are designed on the same scale as the problem - they must be long-run and large-scale solutions.

4 December 1967

22 May 1968.

Dear Professor Friedmann,

I received today your note on training programmes. I think that it is a very interesting contribution to the international discussion in this field. Although I am in general agreement with your approach, I would like to indicate two points of dissent:

1. In trying to promote a system of training programmes and institutions, it must be taken into account that there exist not only different levels of training efforts, but also persons who occupy different positions in the process of regional development (ministers, directors, professionals, politicians, etc.). I have referred to this problem in my note of 4 December 1967, a copy of which is enclosed.

2. I would like to disagree entirely with your statement that at the present time the PhD programmes can be pursued only in the United States. I agree that in the U.S. centres, there are some elements of technical excellence and sophistication which are perhaps the best in the world, but even in this field, I would not be quite sure. I feel that in a PhD programme, technical excellence and sophistication are not the only important factors. I am convinced that centres can be found in Europe, Asia and Latin America that are able to create PhD programmes in regional development and planning which could compete effectively with the U.S. centres, particularly in stressing the experience in planning and programming of regional development activities at the national level, where the U.S. experience is at least limited.

This note of strong disagreement between us shows that there is a need for an international workshop in the near future at which the question of world-wide regional planning-training programmes and their implications with regard to UN activities could be discussed with experts from different continents and different economic and social systems. Etc., Etc.,

Antoni R. Kuklinski

Dr. Aleksander Matejka  
The University of Zambia, Lusaka

31 August 1968

Comments on the training of regional planners for the  
developing countries

The social strategy of planning seems to play in the developing countries even a more important role than in the developed countries. The planning implies the logic and the rationality closely related to the mature technical civilisation. It is self evident that in most of the developing countries, the prevailing mentality not only of the rank-and-file, but even also of the decision makers, is not the same as in the developed countries. It is one of the basic reasons why one has to be very careful applying to the developing countries certain patterns of planning (and especially patterns directly related to the social strategy of planning) which have proved themselves to be successful in the developed countries.

Of course, I take it as granted that planning should be approached not only as the problem of a design, but in its totality as also the problem of an effective policy. It would not make any sense to plan only for its own sake, without bothering about the future implementation of planned tasks.

Concluding the above mentioned remarks, I would like to emphasize the importance of social strategy of planning in the curriculum of training the planners. They should obtain some basic knowledge about: diagnosing the social situation of the particular country or of a particular region, ascertaining the relative power of various social forces which will influence the formulation of tasks as well as their fulfilment, making use in the planning process of social technology, taken in this respect as a sum of



practical implications coming from every empirically verified social knowledge.

The planners should be trained in sociology and social technology - look at the concept of sociotechnics developed in Poland by Professor A. Podgorecki from the University of Warsaw. However, even if such a statement seems to be self-evident in the modern world, I see here some serious difficulties. We should carefully discuss the problem what kind of sociology and social technology should be taught.

Most of the present staff in sociology deals either with some abstract theories or with descriptions of some details which do not have any substantial general meaning. Both kinds of knowledge are not very useful for the planners.

Therefore, it would be advisable to make a careful selection of sociological data and their interpretations from the viewpoints of actual needs of planners. These needs have to be, of course differentiated according to the particular regional problems (e.g. problems characteristic for the various kinds of societies). It would be necessary to establish for this purpose the regional committees of sociologists well acquainted with the problems of the particular region and willing to analyse the existing knowledge from the practical viewpoint.

As regards the types of training activities I would advise to establish the combined programs of studies which would include seminars, post-graduate courses, as well as eventually some longitudinal research work (e.g. in the framework of the Ph.D. studies). The group of planners related to the particular region should have its own training program formulated according to the needs abilities and practical opportunities of this group. Especially short-term training facilities, like seminars, are really fruitful only when they are treated as parts of a broader training program. Every planner should be in constant touch with some experts as his counsellors. The seminar may be a good occasion to meet together, but the bond between trainees and trainers should have a stable character. Etc., etc.,

Dr. Aleksander Matejko  
Professor of Sociology.

Dr. Z.J. Piero  
UN Expert in Regional Planning, Dar es Salaam

2 October 1968

The Concept of Training for Regional  
Development and Planning in Tanzania.

1. Regional Planning Differentials.

The concept of regional planning, its scope, methodology and technique, its dominant features and functions is not uniform throughout the world.

Less developed countries and especially Tanzania, have to divert a lot from the patterns of regional planning practised in developed countries to be a useful, functional tool for development.

In this country, at least for the foreseeable future, regional planning will be agriculture oriented and rural development will be predominant feature of the national development. In U.M. language it is called 'zonal planning and development'.

2. Relationship between practice and training.

The priority of agriculture sector and rural development within the framework of the national economy determines the approach and all major features of development planning and by the same the concept of training for regional planning and development in Tanzania for the time-period until there would be sufficient means for industrialization and big scale urbanization.

Three Tanzanian planners trained in Canada have to re-educate themselves to use fully their capacity as regional in Tanzania; Canadian syllabus was oriented towards metropolitan planning.

Three others have been trained in Kumasi, Ghana, in community planning and they are satisfactorily geared to the day-by-day practice of rural planning exercised in Tanzania. The course of regional planning assistant actually run in Tanzania at the University College Dar es Salaam, after initial erring as to the composition of syllabus, is now satisfactorily geared to rural development in broad meaning with full understanding of the role of industry and towns for rural development in regional and national set-up.

This concept of regional (zonal) planning determined by the exigencies of the national development policy, the level of overall development of the country and the structure of the national economy defines consequently a type of professional know-how of regional planners and model of their training. Evidently this concept will change parallelly to the changes in the national economy and social structures.

### 3. Types of Planning Activities.

Above mentioned conditions under which regional (zonal) planning is to be exercised in developing countries have influenced evolution of different major types of activities in the sphere of regional planning and development. They are common in other parts of the world, but in Tanzania they have a specific meaning, generally they cover all elementary components of the nation's physical, economic and social structures but deal with them in a less sophisticated way than it is done elsewhere.

They are :

- (a) surveying (including land surveying)
- (b) research and programming.
- (c) physical planning.
- (d) implementation.

These activities demand different knowledge and skill. As regional planning is usually a team work and multiphasal work there is good reason to assume differentiated types of training.

#### 4. Regional Planning Surveyors.

In Tanzania there are many white spots in the knowledge of geographical conditions, physical development, mapping on suitable scales, housing, stock production, marketing, services, population. Storage of actual and reliable data is very scanty. A lot of different types of surveying, including land surveying for village planning, must be done before any planning action could be taken. Regional Planning must have its own surveying manpower or people trained in different techniques of surveying to be able to define tasks to specialists and to interpret their data. Under supervision of a few skilled surveyors a host of semi-skilled surveyors could be effective and reliable. The skilled surveyors could be trained on two years specialisation courses for Geography, Economics, Sociology and Political Science. Students undergraduates of the University College. Semi skilled surveyors could be trained at one of the vocational schools; the trainees would be recruited from High-School leavers and undergo one year training at one of the existing vocational schools run by the particular Ministries like Landsurveying School, Water Technicians School.

After certain period of staff saturation middle level, Regional Planners could be trained on under-graduate level at the University College.

#### 5. Training of High Level Regional Planners (research, programming physical planning.)

By research I mean in this context general analysis of data collected by somebody else, or specialistic studies of selected subjects (like feasibility and cost-benefit studies). By programming - preparation of programme of development by economic-

sectors and diversified areas using more advanced techniques. By physical planning - analysis of technical parameters and spatial distribution of human activities and their physical aspects to make proposal of new organization of space in terms of land use and settlement system, as well as detailed town and village layout.

All three types of activities need high level skill and mature personalities. They demand more advanced knowledge in statistics, economics, geography, sociology, engineering and planning to be capable of mastering those tasks, especially on district and regional levels.

There are good reasons to train all three types of specialist in one institution to make them understand all aspects of regional planning and getting used to team work. This knowledge could be got on post-graduate 2-3 years studies. Students could be recruited from graduates in geography, economics, civil engineering, architecture, land surveying, agriculture, sociology with open option for other specialists also, after passing examination.

Until post-graduate studies would be open, specialization in regional planning for geography, economics and sociology for 2nd and 3rd year students could be started. University College in Dar es Salaam has already prepared syllabus and Senate accepted the concept. Lack of Government's standpoint as to number of regional planners to be employed and financial stringencies to invite teachers suspended the idea in vacuum.

#### 6. Training of Development Engineers.

Implementation side of regional planning is the most crucial thing. Countries, like Tanzania, experience a very acute shortage of technicians. Technical know-how among general public is very limited. Even less sophisticated physical plans and technical designs encounter difficulties to be understood by politicians,

administrators and general public. Therefore there is a gap between planning and implementation sides of development. Plans are misunderstood, misinterpreted and forgotten.

There is quite obvious need of more technically advanced 'community development' sort of workers, extension workers etc. They could be called "development engineers" who should have a solid, practical knowledge how to read technical designs and to help villagers how to build a house, water supply, road with bridge and similar things. At the initial stage they would be "jacks of all trades" but later on they should be a mobile team of specialists. Their primary task would be to interpret regional plan into technical drawings and to advise villagers and local authorities how to use building tools, and new materials in self-help schemes. This type of skill at initial stage could be trained jointly with semi-skilled surveyors in the ministerial vocational schools. The candidates from High School leavers, duration of training three years.

#### 7. Final remarks

The problem of regional planning in Tanzania is not only a long-run and large-scale one, it is also not appreciated enough by officials and misunderstood by so-called planners and economic advisors. Therefore the successful solution of the problems depends on the demonstration work of high qualified team of planners, who could be able to prove regional planning utility even at low level of economic technical and social development.

The United Nations should have double role:

- (a) Initiation of regional planning training centres.
- (b) On-the-job training while performing regional planning project jointly with implementation.

These remarks and suggestions are representing academic-professional standpoint and are not official recommendations.

Dr. Z. Piro

SPECIAL PROGRAM FOR URBAN AND REGIONAL STUDIES OF DEVELOPING AREAS

Department of City & Regional Planning  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

October 22, 1968.

Dear Mr. Kuklinski,

Given the tremendous need that will develop during the next decade, I am firmly persuaded that it would be desirable to have a Workshop or Conference to review some of the problems of training of urban and regional planners in developing countries. I am, of course, particularly interested in the subject, not only because of the importance of the problem, but also because of the particular efforts I am now making in the Special Program for Urban and Regional Studies of Developing Areas which I am now directing. This problem is all the more urgent because students from abroad are likely to experience special difficulty in gaining admission to schools in the United States because of the tremendous competition. There is also a serious question whether most of the educational facilities are appropriate to serve their needs.

For a further expression of my views, let me say that I support in general the positions expressed in Paragraphs 1 to 4 by the Working Group on Training and Education Programs for Urban and Regional Development in Latin America at the Santiago Conference (Ricardo Jordán, Rapporteur).

You might also want to examine the Proceedings of the Seminar on Training for Town and Country Planning held in Puerto Rico in March 1956 under the sponsorship of the United Nations (Bulletin of UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, No.11) which incidentally, I helped to organize. Etc., etc.,

Lloyd Rodwin  
Director.

John Owen M. Rowlands  
United Nations Industrial Development Organization  
SUDENE, Recife, Brazil

## INTRODUCTION.

In the abbreviated comments which follow I have been concerned to identify certain practical aspects of regional development programmes to which I suggest that attention should be drawn in the formulation of training programmes as referred to in the main discussion paper. There now exists a wealth of material in the field of regional development, and I am less concerned with the formulation of programmes to seek to reduce regional imparities of development than with the practical translation of such programmes and their successful integration in the administrative, political, legal, etc. machinery of the country involved.

## 2. TYPES OF TRAINING ACTIVITIES.

2.1. Extended Scope of Training. The proposal to employ three main types of training activities - seminars, post-graduate courses, and PhD studies - is in my opinion excellent, so far as it goes. Such a scheme would by your reckoning reach key public officials; professionals interested in interregional and regional development activities; and potential candidates for academic leadership in this field. My doubt is whether this spread would be adequate to achieve meaningful progress in this highly significant field, since it is my view that - other things being equal - it is comparatively easy to plan regional development but extremely difficult to implement such a programme. My experience in recent years has been that in the field of regional development the responsible agency in a developing country is usually a comparative newcomer in the Ministerial hierarchy; its chief officials are generally very able young men, but usually lacking in experience and in the techniques of getting their own way in official discussion; although they may have at their finger-tips skills and techniques in regional development planning of tremendous potential value to their country they are often unable to proceed nearly as far as they might do in the face of long-entrenched (and usually very able) sections of authority in the traditional economic such as the Finance Ministry, the Ministry of Industry, and so on. (I consider that the Spanish Comisaria del Plan, for example, has tackled this problem realistically by appointing carefully chosen technicians in the various Ministries as liaison officers to the Comisaria, and thereby improving the prospects for satisfactory



integration of planning ideologies and techniques in the traditional administrative environment.) I feel that seminars could possibly be expanded very considerably so as to extend the penetration of regional development thinking over a wider range of government personnel, particularly in ministries and agencies which will almost certainly require to surrender some of their traditional prerogatives in the development process.

2.2. Regional Operations. Further, really successful demonstrations of regional development plan implementation at the regional level are not easy to find. Even in cases where a potentially meaningful complex of de-centralized operational units has been established as part of the regional development programme these units usually fail to develop a regional identity or to establish active horizontal communications in a way which would enable them to make an effective contribution to the programme. The usual experience is that sophisticated vertical communications are developed with the capital and/or their administrative headquarters, and the contribution of the regional units fails to rise above that of feeders of regional data (much of which is compiled from existing and usually out-of-date and incomplete statistics, and little of which is derived from original research) to their parent organization. Regional development plan implementation is almost always bedevilled by provincial administrative considerations, and even where existing administrative divisions have been accepted as a fact of life (however inappropriate these may be in the context of economic regions defined according to economic criteria) there is a very real problem in seeking to create a plan awareness at the local level and in gearing local influences towards making a significant contribution to development. In other words, there may well be great scope for extending regional development training so as to include key officials in the provincial administrations concerned.

2.3 Industrial Planning Bias. I am assuming of course that the multidisciplinary nature of regional development planning will be stressed in your training programmes. There is a tendency which can be observed in several countries in recent years to accord undue emphasis to regional industrial (rather than agricultural etc.) development in regional planning. Some of this is due to the lack of experience of many regional development officials, and a preoccupation with the more glamorous and dramatic aspects of development, regardless of their real economic significance. Agricultural development is in most cases more difficult to research adequately; more expensive to develop; less attractive in terms of gestation period etc.; and usually much more difficult to administer and to coordinate properly. These are however problems with which the regional development planner must concern himself,

and I would like to feel that this grass-roots approach will be accorded due significance in the training which the Institute is gearing itself to provide.

2.4 The Private Sector. There is another aspect of regional development which I consider to be extremely important, and that is the role of the private sector. If one has a private sector then I always believe in using it in order to further one's development programmes in a meaningful way, and there is considerable scope for developing techniques for this purpose. One such technique is embodied in the concept of regional development corporations, a device which is outlined as follows: normally such a corporation will involve three main partners, one being a good (often foreign) entrepreneur, responsible for supplying the technical expertise and operating know-how; another partner is a good local entrepreneur, supplying the commercial and marketing know-how, and taking over the stages from outside the factory onwards; while the third partner is an official agency, usually a development bank, which supplies the financial know-how, working capital, etc. and takes responsibility for day-to-day negotiation with government departments etc. in terms of licences and general bureaucratic matters, thus enabling the operational partners to concentrate on the purely productive aspects of the joint enterprise. The operating agreement for this tripartite consortium could be drawn up so as to maximize the potential advantages of the various skills, experience etc. involved; the group could be given a mandate, for example, to develop a certain area of the country on agreed lines, with maximum provision for incorporating local interests in the agricultural, cooperative etc. fields. The private partners would invest in risk capital so as to ensure their interest in achieving successful operation, and - provided the development bank (or similar) partner is sufficiently wide-awake - there should be no undesirable side-effects from this form of collaboration. This is the type of pragmatic thinking which I have generally found lacking in regional development administrators, but it is the type of thinking which in my opinion can make all the difference between well-meaning ideology and effective operational programmes.

2.5 Lack of Emphasis on Pragmatic Approach. There is in my opinion a dangerous tendency towards regional development training in a form which is over-oriented in the direction of the mathematical approach and the use of highly sophisticated econometric techniques; the official who has participated in such training usually returns to his ministry or agency fired with a determination to utilise his new-found knowledge, but is rarely able (in my experience) to use this knowledge effectively. If he does succeed in selling his ideas to his colleagues and superiors in the central government scene, he generally finds that his problems have

really only begun when attempts are made to put the programme into operation at the local level. I feel that in general terms it is impossible to over-emphasize the importance of establishing real points of contact between the regional development planner and the regional/local administrative machinery, since the latter can often make or break the programme. This is one aspect of regional development planning which I trust will be adequately emphasized in the training programmes for which the Institute will be responsible in the process of providing for adequate numbers of trained economists in this field in the future.

2.6 Location of Training. I have found a growing (and very refreshing) tendency in developing countries to feel that development techniques and principles have in most cases been evolved in environments which can offer little basis for comparison with their own situations. It is easy to say that experiences have to be set within the context of local situations to assess their validity, but there may on the other hand be scope for using a developing country in Africa, Asia or Latin America for establishing one of the workshops referred to in the outline formula. It might be difficult to establish a universal validity for regional development principles and methodology evolved on the basis of locating the workshops as suggested in the formula, whatever efforts are made to seek to ensure cross-fertilization of ideas in these locations. In general terms, every country in the world has a regional development problem and situation; in its economic, political, social, etc. dimensions this is one of the great problems of our age, and I feel that the Institute has a significant responsibility and opportunity to show the way in this field, and to achieve a global awareness of its implications and its possibilities.

### 3. CONCLUSION.

I have sought in the foregoing comments to invite attention to certain practical aspects of regional development programmes which I consider to be of significant importance in this field, but which are not always covered in arrangements for training the potentially responsible officials. I feel that the successful regional development economist of the future must be keenly aware of the significance of these aspects of his responsibilities, and I trust that the training programmes motivated by the Institute will incorporate due emphasis thereon in their-overall-orientation.

(The above comments represent no more than the personal views of the writer and do not reflect in any way the viewpoints of the United Nations Industrial Development Organization or any other body.)

Dr. (Miss) P. Sen Gupta  
Ministry of Home Affairs, New Delhi

THE TRAINING OF REGIONAL PLANNERS IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES.

Economic development of a country is not an automatic process, it must be created and invariably stimulated. Many developing countries characteristically exhibit stagnation and unbalanced economic growth. Only longterm regionwise planning can counteract this imbalance and stagnation. Regional planning involves the development of physical and social resources not of regions as isolated fragments but as parts of a complete nation-wide pattern, comprising a number of organized units.

The recognition of regionalization as an essential tool of socio-economic planning in developing countries is very recent and its implementation has not yet taken any concrete shape. Some of the major obstacles to its implementation are as follows:-

- (i) Scarcity of socio-economic data;
- (ii) Insufficient research-activities on regional development and regional planning;
- (iii) Inadequate knowledge of regional problems and problem regions;
- (iv) Inadequate cartographic analysis of regional structure of the economy;
- (v) Dearth of professional regional planners; and
- (vi) Constant changes in national policies in the wake of political instabilities.

Some suggestions on "The Training Programme for Comprehensive Regional Developments in Developing Countries" are put forward as follows:-

1. Preliminary Task

Seminars

The usefulness of regional and inter-regional development scheme is unknown to many of the Government officials of developing countries entrusted with the task of socio-economic planning. They are still traditional in outlook, and hardly appreciate the regional development activities. The programme of regional developments would be difficult

to formulate in a country unless the Government officials at ministerial and directorial level could appreciate this scheme. It would be useful to conduct seminars for discussions among the Government officials and regional experts on strategic problems of regional development with specific example from the respective developing countries. The Institute should make an effort to organise seminars in different regions - developed and underdeveloped - for the exchange of views among experts and officials of both developed and underdeveloped countries at least once in a year in forthcoming period. Experiences gathered by developed countries in the field of regional developments - their success and problems - may be transmitted to developing countries which are still in potential stage of regional developments through discussions at the Seminar.

2. Reasons which justify the Establishment of Training Programme.

After the support is given by the high officials to regional and inter-regional planning activities, there arises the need of regional planners, who are properly trained in the field. In India, for example, the need for a balanced regional development received recognition in the 2nd Five Year Plan (1955-61) and more pointedly in 3rd Five Year Plan (1962-66), but the device to this objective is still in the process of unfolding. Government officials in the field of planning are currently aware of the pressing need of regional planners for achieving the goal. The scarcity of regional planners was a basic problem in implementing the regional development scheme of India in the 3rd Five Year Plan.

3. Inter-disciplinary Approach

Regional planning is a complicated process and it requires a team-work of scientists from various disciplines. It will not be proper to think that an economist or a town/country planner or a geographer can prepare a complete plan for the country, its regions and sub-regions. Experts from various disciplines are to contribute in their respective fields to this regional-development scheme. For example, geographers can prepare a base for planning in the form of a net-work of regions,

description of the regions, suggestions for the best complex utilization of potential resources supplemented by maps, and tables of inventorization of resources. Their discovery and analysis may extend further to regions suffering from harmful consequences of unscientific utilization of resources (floods, alkalinity of soils, soil erosion etc.). The base thus prepared will help the experts from other disciplines to understand the regional problems in their respective fields. It is quite clear that the Training Institute of regional planners would require to provide training of diverse groups of persons from various disciplines, and it would be a time consuming process. So at the primary stage of training, U.N. should provide regional-planners (experts) on a short-term basis to provide advisory services to Governments of underdeveloped countries on request. The types of services would include assistance in delineating planning regions of various taxonomic rank for evaluating the resources and conditions for necessary managements, practices and protection of nature. Advisory services by U.N. are also necessary in a long term basis to serve a particular country as the occasion would demand.

#### 4. International Approach

For such a training programme the smaller countries should be combined with the bigger countries in their immediate neighbourhood. For example, Pakistan, India, Nepal and Bhutan should be treated as one region and this type of combination of countries would not only economise the expenditure on the training programme but also foster a friendly and peaceful co-existence among the countries.

#### 5. Professional Training Courses

Post-graduate courses for training profession regional planners as suggested in the discussion paper 4th December, 1967 by U.N. Research Institute of Social Development should be of a duration of nine months. I would propose that the post-graduate training programme of professional regional planners should be implemented at three levels - (A) a Diploma

Course (First Year); (B) an Advanced Course (Second Year); and (C) a Specialization Course or Ph.D. Course in the Third Year.

A. Diploma Course: - The Diploma Course should be designed to:-

- (a) make the trainee familiar with the geographical environment of the country with the objective of delineating the areas of natural resources - existing and potential;
- (b) familiarize them with the methods of collecting socio-economic data at regional level and representing them in maps with advanced cartographic technique;
- (c) make him conscious of the discovery and study the socio-economic regions which would help them in preparing the base of regional planning and developments; and
- (d) teach him the more fundamental technique in delineating planning regions of various taxonomic ranks and finding out the centre of productive forces in each of the regions - existing and future.

B. Advanced Course:- The students who will show interest, ability and initiative in the study of regional development and regional planning will get in this course an opportunity to extend training for one more year in which they are expected to understand inter-sectoral problems of regional developments as a part of national developments, the integration of regional activities to solve problems at national level, and that of local activities as a part of regional developments to solve problems at regional level because they can not be solved at regional and local level respectively. The main activities to be performed in complying with these objectives are (a) direct participation in research; (b) formal courses; and (c) seminars. The formal Courses should include (i) theories of regional developments, (ii) qualitative approach and quantitative method in delineating planning regions, (iii) interdisciplinary approach to regional planning, (iv) study of growth-centres as instruments of regional development, economic and social integration; (v) types of regional problems and problems regions, and (vi) case studies in regional planning etc.

C. Specialized Course for Ph.D Degree:- This course should be open to students already having two years of training in regional planning and developments. This should be the third year course for specialization. The purpose is to prepare personnel to teach specialized courses in regional planning and regional developments and to render technical assistance in the implementation of inter-regional, regional development policies, programmes and plans. The formal academic activities of these research fellows would be seminars on their readings and research findings in their respective fields and present their own research-results in the form of dissertations.



Dr. Torcuato S. Di Tella  
Latin American Center for Research in the Social Sciences  
Rio de Janeiro

25 October 1968

Dear Dr. Kuklinski,

Regarding your paper on Training in Comprehensive Regional Development and Planning, I agree that this is a very important problem. I would suggest a few extra remarks:

(a) The main bottleneck is not so much the absence of qualified personnel, but the difficulty of having those who are trained incorporated into the public administration. Though we often lack experts, at least in Latin America it is as often the case that the few experts existing are expelled from their countries due to incapacity to absorb them into government. This is not necessarily due to political reasons (also present at times) but due to the difficulty on the part of existing organs of government in accepting the relevance of the new skills. We should ask ourselves to what extent the skills have been developed in such a way that they may become really useful.

(b) Therefore, the point where we can operate with greatest productivity is in doing a double brainwashing operation. We must brainwash the government officials, to make them more "theory oriented", and we must brainwash the advanced students, young planners, and postgraduate trainees, to make them less "theory oriented". The former is mentioned always (by us) but the latter is the place where we have more possibilities to act (and should receive at least as much consideration).

(c) The seminars you propose for government bosses take care of their indoctrination. So far so good. Now for the indoctrination of the postgraduate students. This should take place in those postgraduate courses, which you rightly stress as the main training grounds for the new profession. What I would suggest here is those postgraduate courses should have, as their main object, to de-theorize the pompous, eyes in the sky, and pedantic sociology graduates which we produce in such great numbers.

For this purpose, it would not be a bad idea to have those post graduate courses accept as students a wide assortment of people, that is, not only from sociology and economics, but also from architecture, business or public administration, and such other menial professions. The result will not be very easy to manage, and much time will be lost, from an academic point of view, in learning each other's language. But this latter is precisely the thing which should be promoted, and the main indicator of success of the course. Only in this way will the graduates become capacitated to tackle their jobs, in the somewhat remote case they get them. Connection with community development schemes should also prove useful in this connection. Community development is one of the most despised subject matters for our young sociologists, but it can provide - whatever else it does or fails to do to the local communities - an ideal place for them to open their eyes to local reality ( which generally they haven't even smelled from a distance).

I hope after undergoing all these operations our young (or by that time not so young) sociologists and social scientists will still retain enough salt to be a very dynamic lever of social change in their countries.

Etc., etc.,

Torcuato S. Di Tella.